

1321st meeting, 4 July 2018

10 Legal questions

10.2 European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages

Seventh report of the Committee of Experts in respect of Norway

In accordance with Article 16 paragraph 3 of the Charter, the Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages submits its seventh report on the application of the Charter in Norway to the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe. The report contains proposals for recommendations to be addressed by the Committee of Ministers to Norway. The Norwegian Government has been given the opportunity to comment on the content, in accordance with Article 16 paragraph 3 of the Charter.

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages provides for a control mechanism to evaluate how the Charter is applied in a State Party with a view to, where necessary, making recommendations for improving their legislation, policy and practices. The central element of this procedure is the Committee of Experts, set up under Article 17 of the Charter. Its principal purpose is to report to the Committee of Ministers on its evaluation of compliance by a Party with its undertakings, to examine the real situation of regional or minority languages in the State and, where appropriate, to encourage the Party to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

To facilitate this task, the Committee of Ministers adopted, in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 1, an outline for periodical reports that a Party is required to submit to the Secretary General. This outline requires the State to give an account of the concrete application of the Charter, the general policy for the languages protected under Part II and, in more precise terms, all measures that have been taken in application of the provisions chosen for each language protected under Part III of the Charter. The Committee of Experts' first task is therefore to examine the information contained in the periodical report for all the relevant regional or minority languages on the territory of the State concerned. The periodical report shall be made public by the State in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 2.

The Committee of Experts' role is to evaluate the existing legal acts, regulations and real practice applied in each State for its regional or minority languages. It has established its working methods accordingly. The Committee of Experts gathers information from the respective authorities and from independent sources within the State, in order to obtain a fair and just overview of the real language situation. After a preliminary examination of a periodical report, the Committee of Experts submits, if necessary, a number of questions to each Party to obtain supplementary information from the authorities on matters it considers insufficiently developed in the report itself. This written procedure is usually followed up by an on-the-spot visit by a delegation of the Committee of Experts to the State in question. During this visit the delegation meets bodies and associations whose work is closely related to the use of the relevant languages, and consults the authorities on matters that have been brought to its attention. This information-gathering process is designed to enable the Committee of Experts to evaluate more effectively the application of the Charter in the State concerned.

Having concluded this process, the Committee of Experts adopts its own report. Once adopted by the Committee of Experts, this evaluation report is submitted to the authorities of the respective State Party for possible comments within a given deadline. Subsequently, the evaluation report is submitted to the Committee of Ministers, together with suggestions for recommendations that, once adopted by the latter, will be addressed to the State Party. The full report also contains the comments which the authorities of the State Party may have made.

CONTENTS

Executive Summary	4
Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in Norway – Recent developments and trends	5
1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in Norway	5
1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Norway	7
Chapter 2 Compliance of Norway with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations	9
2.1 Finnish	9
2.1.1 Compliance of Norway with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Finnish	9
2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Finnish in Norway	10
2.2 Kven	11
2.2.1 Compliance of Norway with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Kven	11
2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Kven in Norway	12
2.3 Lule Sami	13
2.3.1 Compliance of Norway with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Lule Sami	13
2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Lule Sami in Norway.....	17
2.4 North Sami	18
2.4.1 Compliance of Norway with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of North Sami	18
2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of North Sami in Norway.....	21
2.5 Romani	23
2.5.1 Compliance of Norway with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Romani.....	23
2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Romani in Norway	24
2.6 Romanes	25
2.6.1 Compliance of Norway with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Romanes.....	25
2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Romanes in Norway	26
2.7 South Sami	27
2.7.1 Compliance of Norway with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of South Sami	27
2.7.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of South Sami in Norway	30
Chapter 3 Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe	32
Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification	33
Appendix II: Comments from the Norwegian authorities	34

Executive Summary

The seventh evaluation report by the Committee of Experts is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts' on-the-spot visit to Norway in October 2017.

Norway was the first State to ratify the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages in 1993 and it entered into force in Norway in 1998. The Charter applies to Finnish, Kven, Romani, Romanes and Lule Sami, North Sami, and South Sami. Lule Sami, North Sami and South Sami fall within the scope of Part III of the Charter. The other languages fall only within the scope of Part II.

North Sami is the most widely used Sami language. Lule Sami and South Sami have fewer speakers and face more serious challenges. The Sami Parliament is entrusted with the protection and promotion of all Sami languages.

Almost all undertakings under Part III of the Charter are fulfilled for North Sami. Difficulties persist with the use of special characters in public registers in North Sami and Lule Sami. There are also difficulties with respect to the use of all Sami languages in social care facilities. There is a need to further support the training of journalists and other staff for media using all Sami languages.

Lule Sami and South Sami are still in a difficult situation. The main challenges remain in education and public services. It is important to improve the provisions of teaching in and of the languages at all appropriate levels and to strengthen teacher training.

The Kven language is still in a precarious situation. There is a traditional presence of Finnish alongside Kven. The need for measures to promote the two languages, especially in education, still persists.

Romani and Romanes are almost invisible in public life. They lack prestige and there is a need for special measures to protect and promote them, particularly in education.

Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in Norway – Recent developments and trends

1. The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereafter referred to as “the Charter”) was signed by Norway on 5 November 1992. The instrument of ratification was deposited on 10 November 1993 and the Charter entered into force in Norway on 1 March 1998.
2. Article 15.1 of the Charter requires States Parties to submit three-yearly reports in a form prescribed by the Committee of Ministers.¹ The authorities of Norway presented their seventh periodical report to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe on 10 March 2017.
3. This seventh Committee of Experts evaluation report is based on the information contained in the seventh periodical report of Norway and obtained through interviews held with representatives of the minority language speakers in Norway and with the Norwegian authorities during the on-the-spot visit which took place from 9 to 11 October 2017.
4. The Committee of Experts will focus on the provisions and issues under both Part II and Part III which were singled out in the sixth evaluation report as raising particular problems. It will evaluate, in particular, how the Norwegian authorities have reacted to the observations and recommendations made by the Committee of Experts and the recommendations made by the Committee of Ministers. The Committee of Experts will also examine new issues detected during the seventh monitoring cycle.
5. The report contains detailed observations and recommendations which the Norwegian authorities are urged to take into account when developing their policy on regional or minority languages. On this basis, the Committee of Experts has also established proposals for recommendations to be addressed to Norway by the Committee of Ministers, as provided in Article 16.4 of the Charter.
6. This report is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts’ on-the-spot visit to Norway on 9-11 October 2017. It was adopted by the Committee of Experts on 24 November 2017.

1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in Norway

Undertakings under the Charter

7. Norway ratified the Charter for ‘the Sami language’ under Part III without naming the specific Sami languages. In the initial periodical report, the Norwegian authorities referred again only to ‘the Sami language’. In later periodical reports, the Norwegian authorities stated that Lule Sami and South Sami should be treated as Part II languages. However, since Norway ratified the Charter for ‘the Sami language’ under Part III, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to decide that Lule Sami and South Sami should be treated as Part II languages only. In the present evaluation report, Lule Sami and South Sami have been treated as Part III languages.
8. As during previous monitoring cycles, the Committee of Experts was informed by Kven speakers that they wish Kven to also be covered by Part III of the Charter.
9. There is a lack of awareness regarding Part II languages as well as Lule Sami and South Sami.

Situation of Kven and Finnish

10. Kven and Finnish have the same roots and a long traditional presence in Norway. Therefore, Norway stated in its initial periodical report that “Kven/Finnish” is covered by Part II of the Charter in Norway². In 2005, Norway recognised Kven as a language in its own right. This decision corresponds to the views of those Kven speakers who call their language Kven and are favourable to the introduction of the new standardised written form. During on-the-spot visits and in statements pursuant to Article 16 (2), some representatives of Kven and of Norwegian Finns informed the Committee of Experts that they continue using Finnish. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will deal with Kven and Finnish separately.

¹ MIN-LANG(2009)8 Outline for three-yearly periodical reports as adopted by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe

² MIN-LANG/PR(99)5 (<https://rm.coe.int/16806c8e3d>), Initial Periodical Report by Norway, pages 2 and 3

Practical implementation of the Charter

11. While the situation of North Sami is overall satisfactory, both Lule Sami and South Sami are in an unfavourable situation, despite some efforts made. Norwegian Romani and Romanes are still not codified but this should not prevent the authorities from taking measures towards the implementation of undertakings of the Charter with regard to Romani and Romanes, namely in broadcast media as well as in education. The latter would concern pre-school level. As for Finnish and Kven, the Committee of Experts considers that the Norwegian authorities should consult the representatives as well as the relevant local and regional authorities with a view to drawing up a medium-term strategy on the implementation of the Charter in respect of both languages. There is a need for a more effective inclusion of awareness of Finnish, Kven, Romani and Romanes, Lule Sami and South Sami as minority languages in Norway among the objectives of education, teacher training and media.

Use of the minority languages in education

12. There is an urgent need for teacher training and creation of teaching materials based on works for codifying Romani and Romanes. The introduction of pre-school education in Finnish still needs to be implemented, in co-operation with the speakers. A study programme in Kven had been created at university, then discontinued recently, but seems to have resumed at the time of the on-the-spot visit. The offer of education in Lule Sami is satisfactory. The survival of South Sami is endangered by the decrease in availability of primary education in this language. Technical and vocational education is not offered in any of the minority languages, apart from one school providing this in North Sami. Apart from Finnish, there are no sufficient facilities available that would enable non-speakers of minority languages to learn them, even in territories in which they are traditionally used.

Use of the minority languages by judicial authorities

13. The overall demand for the use of the Sami languages in contact with judicial authorities is sparse. The lack of trained interpreters is another factor that limits the use of minority languages by courts. Staff recruitment increasingly takes into consideration the knowledge of North Sami in the penitentiary system.

Use of the minority languages by administrative authorities

14. Progress has been made with the use of Sami special characters in central administration, including for family names. A further inclusion of Sami special characters on online forms is still needed, *inter alia* in tax administration. The use of minority languages in contact with administrative authorities and public services is also characterised by the sparse demand and the lack of trained interpreters. During the on-the-spot visit, the speakers expressed concerns about the potential negative effect of the pending national reform of the territorial administrative units.

Use of the minority languages in media

15. The position of North Sami in both written and electronic media is satisfactory. The very limited media offer in both Lule Sami and South Sami needs to be increased. Romani and Romanes is not present in media. The weekly radio programmes which did exist in Kven and in Finnish were discontinued with the transition to digital broadcasting.

Use of the minority languages in cultural activities and facilities

16. Most minority languages are used in cultural activities. The Committee of Experts has not received any information on the implementation of a number of undertakings regarding the use of the Sami languages in cultural life: ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of the minority languages (12.1.e); In territories other than those in which the minority languages are traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using the minority languages (12.2); make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for the minority languages and the culture they reflect (12.3).

Use of the minority languages in economic and social life

17. Staff members of social and health care institutions, particularly in hospitals and retirement homes, have insufficient knowledge of the Sami languages.

Situation of Skolt Sami / Eastern Sami

18. It is unclear to the Committee of Experts whether there are speakers of Skolt Sami / Eastern Sami in Norway today. Nevertheless, the Committee of Experts commends the initiative by the Norwegian authorities, in co-operation with Finland and the Russian Federation, which aims at revitalising the Skolt Sami / Eastern Sami language.

1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Norway

19. There has not been a strong literacy tradition in Finnish or Kven in Norway. Nevertheless, Finnish was used to some extent in writing, particularly in religious contexts. The traditional use of Finnish has been reinforced by recent immigration from Finland. Some Kven people prefer to write standard Finnish, and expressed concern that standardisation and revitalisation efforts targeting the Kven language would weaken the position of Finnish.

20. Pre-school education is not offered in Finnish. Primary and lower secondary school pupils in Troms and Finnmark counties have the right to receive Finnish tuition if certain conditions are met. The University of Tromsø offers a MA programme in Kven and Finnish and a BA programme in Finnish.

21. There used to be a weekly radio broadcast in Finnish, but after the transition to digital radio, this has been discontinued. There is a need for a more effective inclusion and awareness of Finnish as a minority language in Norway in education and media.

22. Kven was recognised as a separate language in 2005 by the Norwegian authorities. A written standard has been developed and a descriptive grammar book was published in 2014. Currently, the standard is being revised to take geographical variations into account. The Norwegian authorities organised an event with the intention to discuss an action plan on the Kven language in April 2016, but have yet to initiate work on a targeted plan for the revitalisation of Kven. As Kven is a severely endangered language, there is an urgent need to develop and implement such a plan.

23. Pre-school education is not offered in Kven, but there is a temporary language nest programme in the municipality of Porsanger. Primary and lower secondary school pupils in Troms and Finnmark counties have the right to receive Finnish tuition if the number of pupils is sufficient. Kven is considered under the national curriculum of Finnish as a second language, but there is still a lack of qualified teachers. The number of pupils learning Finnish as a second language has decreased steadily. The University of Tromsø offers a MA programme in Kven and Finnish, but no BA programme in Kven, although some courses are offered.

24. There used to be a weekly radio broadcast in Kven, but after the transition to digital radio, this has been discontinued. There is a need for a more effective inclusion and awareness of Kven as a minority language in Norway in education and media.

25. Most provisions of the Charter still need to be implemented for Romani and Romanes. The Committee of Experts has not received sufficient information about the situation of Romanes, which makes the evaluation difficult. There is still no action plan for the protection and promotion of Romani and Romanes. Romani studies as the subject of a PhD research has been introduced at Oslo University and a thesis as well as an online dictionary have been published. Nevertheless, Romani and Romanes are not present in formal education nor in media. Furthermore, trained staff and teaching materials are missing. Grants were allocated by a State-financed foundation for Romani people / Tater culture (Stiftelsen Romanifolkets / taternes kulturfond) to different projects. However, the State support to this foundation for 2015 and 2016 has been withheld.

Sami languages

26. **North Sami**, the most widely spoken of the Sami languages in Norway, is in a satisfactory situation. Most of the undertakings under the Charter are fulfilled for this language. With regard to the administrative authorities and public services, although requests to the Norwegian Tax Administration can be submitted in North Sami, both in writing and orally, electronic tax returns must be submitted in Norwegian. Measures should also be taken to ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals and retirement homes offer services in North Sami. Furthermore, during the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed that there are still problems with the use of Sami letters in public registers. The authorities explained that the delay is attributed to the development of the software.

27. The Sami Parliament of Norway is elected by and among the Sami people. It is an indigenous people's parliamentary governance and is funded by the Norwegian Government. The Sami Act provides that the Sami Parliament's mandate includes all issues that the Parliament considers to relate to the Sami people in Norway. It also has the authority to make decisions when this follows from legislative or administrative provisions. The Sami Parliament is entrusted with the protection and promotion of all Sami languages.

28. Most undertakings are only partly or formally fulfilled for **Lule Sami**. The County Governor of Nordland is the coordinating body for both Lule Sami and South Sami education in Norway. Since an increasing number of speakers are now living in cities outside of the administrative area, there is no guarantee of places for their children in Lule Sami and South Sami kindergartens. There is a lack of Lule Sami teachers, as there are only eight teachers in Lule Sami in elementary and lower secondary education, of which six are qualified as teachers and have formal competences in Lule Sami. At upper secondary school, there are four Lule Sami teachers. All have formal competences in Lule Sami, and two of them have a teaching degree. However, despite the insufficient number of Lule Sami teachers, according to the County Governor of Nordland, between 2006-2016, the total number of elementary and lower secondary pupils for Lule Sami as a second language increased by 44% (from 75 to 104) as a result of the Second Language acquisition and distance teaching Ulpan Courses³. The number of schools offering Lule Sami has also substantially increased. Additional efforts are needed, especially in the field of education, and in particular the development of curricula, teaching materials and teacher training. There are study and research options available at university level.

29. The situation of **South Sami** has not substantially improved since the previous monitoring cycle, although some efforts have been made to provide teaching in and of South Sami. Under the Action Plan for Sami Languages, a teacher training programme in South Sami is currently being developed, based on the Ulpan method. The South Sami school in Hattfjelldal in the County of Nordland has been re-established as a Language Resource Centre in 2017 and offers teaching to 63 South Sami students in the school year 2017-2018. However, the Committee of Experts was also informed during the on-the-spot visit that there was a lack of knowledge among local authorities about the children's rights to be taught in South Sami. Funding is also problematic, as it is not covered by the Norwegian government and depends on the decisions and the finances of the municipality. There is still no South Sami BA or MA degree programme in Norway. Nevertheless, Nord University in Levanger provides entry-level courses in South Sami, South Sami level 1 and level 2 and South Sami language and culture. However, these courses are offered separately and are not part of a complete bachelor's degree, although they can be incorporated into the teacher training programme and the kindergarten teacher training programme. In general, additional efforts are needed, especially in the field of education, and in particular the development of curricula, teaching materials and teacher training.

³ MIN-LANG/PR (2012) 1 (<https://rm.coe.int/16806c8e52>), Fifth Periodical Report by Norway, page 22.

Chapter 2 Compliance of Norway with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations

2.1 Finnish

2.1.1 Compliance of Norway with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Finnish

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:
 ↗ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Norway concerning Finnish ⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Finnish as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Finnish		=			
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Finnish		↗			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Finnish, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		✓			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Finnish • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Finnish at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Finnish to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Finnish at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Finnish	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Finnish	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Finnish among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Finnish among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Finnish • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Finnish 		=			

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

⁴ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

30. Finnish has not been present in broadcast media since the start of 2017. There is a decrease in knowledge of Finnish among staff of social and health care institutions. (Article 7.1.d)

31. In 2016, the development of a targeted plan for revitalising the Finnish language was facilitated by a scientific event organised by the relevant ministry and Finnish organisations and institutions, however a targeted plan is still not in place at national level. Upon the initiative of Troms county, the ministry granted Troms county authority funding to prepare a Finnish action plan for the county. (Article 7.1.c)

2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Finnish in Norway

The Committee of Experts encourages the Norwegian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.1.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Norway has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Norway⁵ remain valid in their own right.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Adopt and implement national and regional action plans for Finnish.**
- b. **Take appropriate measures to reintroduce Finnish in broadcasting.**
- c. **Create an offer of Finnish as a mother tongue in pre-school education.**

II. Further recommendations

- d. Strengthen the consultation mechanism with the Finnish speakers in order to be able to take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the Finnish speakers.
- e. Take resolute action to raise awareness about Finnish as a minority language in Norway.
- f. Ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not create obstacles for the promotion of Finnish.
- g. Promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Finnish among the objectives of education and media.

⁵ RecChL(2001)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016804dce9d); RecChL(2003)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805df248); CM/RecChL(2007)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805afe1b); CM/RecChL(2010)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805cf75c); CM/RecChL(2012)8 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9276); CM/RecChL(2015)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c2ba9).

2.2 Kven

2.2.1 Compliance of Norway with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Kven

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Norway concerning Kven ⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Kven as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Kven		=			
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Kven		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Kven, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		↗			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Kven • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Kven at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Kven to learn it		=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Kven at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Kven	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Kven	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Kven among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Kven among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Kven • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Kven 		=			

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

⁶ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

32. In 2016, the development of a targeted plan for revitalising the Kven language was facilitated by a scientific event organised by the competent ministry and Kven organisations and institutions, however a targeted plan is still not in place at national level. Upon the initiative of Troms county, the ministry granted Troms county authority funding to prepare a Kven action plan for the county. (Article 7.1.c)

2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Kven in Norway

The Committee of Experts encourages the Norwegian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.2.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Norway has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Norway⁷ remain valid in their own right.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. Adopt and implement national and regional action plans for Kven.**
- b. Take appropriate measures to reintroduce Kven in broadcasting.**
- c. Improve the situation of Kven in primary and secondary education and enhance the offer of Kven language nests in pre-school education.**

II. Further recommendations

- d. Take resolute action to raise awareness about Kven as a minority language in Norway.
- e. Ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not create obstacles for the promotion of Kven.
- f. Improve the provision of facilities enabling non-speakers, including adult non-speakers, of Kven to learn it.
- g. Promote the study and research on Kven at universities or equivalent institutions.
- h. Strengthen the consultation mechanism with the Kven speakers in order to be able to take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the Kven speakers.

⁷ RecChL(2001)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016804dce9d);
 RecChL(2003)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805df248);
 CM/RecChL(2007)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805afe1b);
 CM/RecChL(2010)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805cf75c);
 CM/RecChL(2012)8 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9276);
 CM/RecChL(2015)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c2ba9).

2.3 Lule Sami

2.3.1 Compliance of Norway with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Lule Sami

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Norway concerning Lule Sami ⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Lule Sami as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Lule Sami	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Lule Sami		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Lule Sami, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Lule Sami • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Lule Sami at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Lule Sami to learn it		=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Lule Sami at universities or equivalent institutions		↗			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Lule Sami	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Lule Sami	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Lule Sami among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Lule Sami among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Lule Sami • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Lule Sami 	=				
Part III of the Charter						
(Additional undertakings chosen by the State for specific languages)						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.iiii	make available pre-school education in Lule Sami or a substantial part of pre-school education in Lule Sami at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			

⁸ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Norway concerning Lule Sami⁹	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Lule Sami, a substantial part of primary education in Lule Sami or teaching of Lule Sami as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	↗				
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Lule Sami, a substantial part of secondary education in Lule Sami or teaching of Lule Sami as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient		↗			
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Lule Sami, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Lule Sami or teaching of Lule Sami as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient					=
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Lule Sami as an university and higher education subject		↗			
8.1.fii	offer Lule Sami as a subject of adult and continuing education					=
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Lule Sami		↗			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Lule Sami		=			
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Lule Sami and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings	=				
8.2	in territories other than those in which Lule Sami is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Lule Sami at all the appropriate stages of education		=			
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aiv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Lule Sami, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			=		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Lule Sami in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Lule Sami and the related use of documents and evidence in Lule Sami, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned			=		
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Lule Sami	=				
9.3	make available in Lule Sami the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Lule Sami					=
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Lule Sami may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Lule Sami			=		
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Lule Sami or in bilingual versions					=
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Lule Sami			=		

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Norway concerning Lule Sami⁹	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.a	use of Lule Sami within the framework of the regional or local authority			=		
10.2.b	possibility for users of Lule Sami to submit oral or written applications in Lule Sami to the regional or local authority			=		
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Lule Sami			=		
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Lule Sami			=		
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Lule Sami in debates in their assemblies					=
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Lule Sami in debates in their assemblies					=
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Lule Sami		=			
10.3.b	allow users of Lule Sami to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Lule Sami			=		
10.4.a	translation or interpretation		=			
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Lule Sami		=			
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.iii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Lule Sami		=			
11.1.bi	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private radio station in Lule Sami					=
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Lule Sami on a regular basis				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Lule Sami		=			
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Lule Sami					=
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Lule Sami		=			
11.2	guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Lule Sami <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Lule Sami • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Lule Sami 	=				
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Lule Sami		=			
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Lule Sami language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Lule Sami	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Lule Sami in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Lule Sami	=				

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Norway concerning Lule Sami ⁹	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
12.2	In territories other than those in which Lule Sami is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Lule Sami					=
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Lule Sami and the culture it reflects					=
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Lule Sami		=			
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in Lule Sami				=	
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.b	for the benefit of Lule Sami, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Lule Sami is used in identical or similar form	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

33. A research project has been established by Nord University and Árran Lule Sami Language and Culture Centre to develop curricula and teaching materials for an offer of education in and of Lule Sami. By 2016, a total of 24 students completed the bachelor's programme on Lule Sami language and culture, established in 2012, at Nord University in Bodø. However, it has not been possible to start a full programme every year, due to difficulties in finding qualified lecturers in Lule Sami. (Article 7.1.h; Article 8.1.eii; Article 8.1.g)

34. In 2014, a plan was adopted for South, North and Lule Sami distance learning. The County Governors of Finnmark and Nordland are now working on competence building, which consists of teaching qualifications, distance learning didactics and language methodology suitable for distance learning. The aim is that all providers will have adequate expertise in all of these areas by 2020. (Article 8.1.biv; Article 8.1.civ)

2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Lule Sami in Norway

The Committee of Experts encourages the Norwegian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.3.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Norway has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Norway⁹ remain valid in their own right.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Provide forms and means for the teaching and study of Lule Sami at all appropriate stages, including by distance learning, and with sufficient capacity and availability, including teacher training and teaching materials, at least at pre-school and primary level.**
- b. **Encourage the use of Lule Sami, in speech and writing, in education, media as well as in cultural activities.**
- c. **Ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals and retirement homes offer services in Lule Sami.**

II. Further recommendations

- d. Take resolute action to raise awareness about Lule Sami as a minority language in Norway and facilitate its recognition in education, teacher training and media as an expression of cultural wealth.
- e. Provide facilities enabling non-speakers, including adult non-speakers, of Lule Sami to learn it.
- f. Ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not create obstacles for the promotion of Lule Sami.
- g. Offer Lule Sami as a subject of adult and continuing education.
- h. Ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Lule Sami.
- i. In territories other than those in which Lule Sami is traditionally used, extend teaching in or of Lule Sami at all the appropriate stages of education.
- j. Continue efforts to use or adopt additional place names in Lule Sami, in co-operation with the speakers.
- k. Ensure that all official registers support Sami characters.
- l. Enhance the offer of media programmes and printed media production in Lule Sami.

⁹ RecChL(2001)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016804dce9d); RecChL(2003)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805df248); CM/RecChL(2007)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805afe1b); CM/RecChL(2010)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805cf75c); CM/RecChL(2012)8 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9276); CM/RecChL(2015)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c2ba9).

2.4 North Sami

2.4.1 Compliance of Norway with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of North Sami

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Norway concerning North Sami ¹⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of North Sami as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of North Sami	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote North Sami	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of North Sami, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life	=				
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using North Sami • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of North Sami at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of North Sami to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on North Sami at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of North Sami	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of North Sami	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to North Sami among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to North Sami among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses North Sami • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to North Sami 	=				
Part III of the Charter						
(Additional undertakings chosen by the State for specific languages)						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.a.iii	make available pre-school education in North Sami or a substantial part of pre-school education in North Sami at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				

¹⁰ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Norway concerning North Sami¹¹	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.biv	make available primary education in North Sami, a substantial part of primary education in North Sami or teaching of North Sami as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in North Sami, a substantial part of secondary education in North Sami or teaching of North Sami as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in North Sami, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in North Sami or teaching of North Sami as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of North Sami as an university and higher education subject	=				
8.1.fii	offer North Sami as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by North Sami	=				
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) North Sami	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of North Sami and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings	=				
8.2	in territories other than those in which North Sami is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of North Sami at all the appropriate stages of education	=				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aiv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in North Sami, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in North Sami in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in North Sami and the related use of documents and evidence in North Sami, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in North Sami	=				
9.3	make available in North Sami the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of North Sami	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of North Sami may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in North Sami	=				
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in North Sami or in bilingual versions	=				
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in North Sami	=				
10.2.a	use of North Sami within the framework of the regional or local authority	=				

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Norway concerning North Sami¹¹	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.b	possibility for users of North Sami to submit oral or written applications in North Sami to the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in North Sami	=				
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in North Sami	=				
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of North Sami in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.f	use by local authorities of North Sami in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in North Sami	=				
10.3.b	allow users of North Sami to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in North Sami	=				
10.4.a	translation or interpretation		=			
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in North Sami		=			
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.a.iii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in North Sami	=				
11.1.bi	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private radio station in North Sami	=				
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in North Sami on a regular basis	=				
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in North Sami	=				
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in North Sami	=				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using North Sami	=				
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in North Sami • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in North Sami • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in North Sami 	=				
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in North Sami	=				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the North Sami language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of North Sami	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of North Sami in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in North Sami	=				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in North Sami	=				

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Norway concerning North Sami ¹¹	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
12.2	In territories other than those in which North Sami is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using North Sami	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for North Sami and the culture it reflects	=				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of North Sami		✓			
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in North Sami	=				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.b	for the benefit of North Sami, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory North Sami is used in identical or similar form	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

35. Although there is some progress in the access to language use in the prison system, the situation has weakened in hospitals and retirement homes due to the lack of North Sami-speaking staff (Article 13.2.c).

2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of North Sami in Norway

The Committee of Experts encourages the Norwegian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.4.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Norway has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Norway¹¹ remain valid in their own right.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- | | |
|----|--|
| a. | Ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals and retirement homes offer services in North Sami. |
| b. | Ensure that all official registers support Sami characters. |

¹¹ RecChL(2001)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016804dce9d); RecChL(2003)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805df248); CM/RecChL(2007)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805afe1b); CM/RecChL(2010)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805cf75c); CM/RecChL(2012)8 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9276); CM/RecChL(2015)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c2ba9).

II. Further recommendations

- c. Enhance the availability of translation and interpretation from and into North Sami for speakers in contact with authorities and public services, by promoting and supporting the training and recruiting of translators and interpreters.

2.5 Romani

2.5.1 Compliance of Norway with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Romani

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Norway concerning Romani ¹²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Romani as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Romani					=
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Romani					↘
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Romani, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Romani • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Romani at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Romani to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Romani at universities or equivalent institutions		↗			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Romani					=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Romani		=			
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romani among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romani among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Romani • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Romani 		=			

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

In its evaluation of the application of Art. 7.1-7.4 to Romani, the Committee of Experts has kept in mind that these provisions should be applied *mutatis mutandis*.

¹² In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

36. The authorities informed the Committee that the funding of the State-financed foundation for Romani people / Tater culture (Stiftelsen Romanifolkets / taternes kulturfond) has stopped due to the alleged mismanagement (Article 7.1.c).

37. The Norwegian authorities funded a PhD project (2014-2017) on Romani language, resulting in a PhD thesis and an online Romani dictionary (Article 7.1.h).

2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Romani in Norway

The Committee of Experts encourages the Norwegian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.5.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Norway has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Norway¹³ remain valid in their own right.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Take proactive measures to promote Romani, in co-operation with the speakers.**
- b. **Encourage the use of spoken and written Romani in education, media as well as in cultural activities and facilities.**
- c. **Eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Romani.**
- d. **Promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romani among the objectives of education, teacher training and media.**

II. Further recommendations

- e. Facilitate the recognition of Romani and take resolute action to raise awareness about Romani as an expression of cultural wealth.
- f. Continue efforts to encourage university-level research and teaching on Romani.
- g. Promote transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Romani.
- h. Strengthen the consultation mechanism with the Romani speakers in order to be able to take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the Romani speakers.

¹³ RecChL(2001)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016804dce9d); RecChL(2003)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805df248); CM/RecChL(2007)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805afe1b); CM/RecChL(2010)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805cf75c); CM/RecChL(2012)8 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9276); CM/RecChL(2015)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c2ba9).

2.6 Romanes

2.6.1 Compliance of Norway with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Romanes

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Norway concerning Romanes ¹⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Romanes as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Romanes					=
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Romanes					=
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Romanes, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life					=
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Romanes • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Romanes at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Romanes to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Romanes at universities or equivalent institutions					=
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Romanes					=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Romanes		=			
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romanes among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romanes among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Romanes • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Romanes 		=			

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

¹⁴ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

In its evaluation of the application of Art. 7.1-7.4 to Romanes, the Committee of Experts has kept in mind that these provisions should be applied *mutatis mutandis*.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Romanes in Norway

The Committee of Experts encourages the Norwegian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.6.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Norway has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Norway¹⁵ remain valid in their own right.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Provide information about the situation of Romanes as a separate language.**
- b. **Take proactive measures to promote Romanes, in co-operation with the speakers.**
- c. **Encourage the use of Romanes, in speech and writing, in education, media as well as in cultural activities and facilities.**
- d. **Eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Romanes.**
- e. **Promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romanes among the objectives of education, teacher training and media.**

II. Further recommendations

- f. Facilitate the recognition of Romanes and take resolute action to raise awareness about Romanes as an expression of cultural wealth.
- g. Encourage university-level research and teaching on Romanes.
- h. Promote transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Romanes.
- i. Strengthen the consultation mechanism with the Romanes speakers in order to be able to take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the Romanes.

¹⁵ RecChL(2001)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016804dce9d); RecChL(2003)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805df248); CM/RecChL(2007)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805afe1b); CM/RecChL(2010)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805cf75c); CM/RecChL(2012)8 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9276); CM/RecChL(2015)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c2ba9).

2.7 South Sami

2.7.1 Compliance of Norway with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of South Sami

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle:

↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Norway concerning South Sami ¹⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
<i>(Undertakings which the State must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of South Sami as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of South Sami	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote South Sami		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of South Sami, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using South Sami • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of South Sami at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of South Sami to learn it		=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on South Sami at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of South Sami	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of South Sami	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to South Sami among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to South Sami among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses South Sami • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to South Sami 	=				
Part III of the Charter						
<i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the State for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.a.iii	make available pre-school education in South Sami or a substantial part of pre-school education in South Sami at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			

¹⁶ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Norway concerning South Sami¹⁷	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.biv	make available primary education in South Sami, a substantial part of primary education in South Sami or teaching of South Sami as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		✓			
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in South Sami, a substantial part of secondary education in South Sami or teaching of South Sami as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in South Sami, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in South Sami or teaching of South Sami as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient					=
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of South Sami as an university and higher education subject	=				
8.1.fii	offer South Sami as a subject of adult and continuing education					=
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by South Sami		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) South Sami		=			
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of South Sami and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings	=				
8.2	in territories other than those in which South Sami is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of South Sami at all the appropriate stages of education					=
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aiv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in South Sami, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			=		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in South Sami in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in South Sami and the related use of documents and evidence in South Sami, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned			=		
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in South Sami	=				
9.3	make available in South Sami the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of South Sami					=
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.a.ii	ensure that users of South Sami may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in South Sami			=		
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in South Sami or in bilingual versions					=
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in South Sami			=		
10.2.a	use of South Sami within the framework of the regional or local authority			=		

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Norway concerning South Sami¹⁷	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.b	possibility for users of South Sami to submit oral or written applications in South Sami to the regional or local authority			=		
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in South Sami			=		
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in South Sami			=		
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of South Sami in debates in their assemblies					=
10.2.f	use by local authorities of South Sami in debates in their assemblies					=
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in South Sami		=			
10.3.b	allow users of South Sami to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in South Sami			=		
10.4.a	translation or interpretation		=			
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in South Sami	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai ii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in South Sami		=			
11.1.bi	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private radio station in South Sami					=
11.1.ci i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in South Sami on a regular basis				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in South Sami		=			
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in South Sami					=
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using South Sami		=			
11.2	guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in South Sami • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in South Sami • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in South Sami	=				
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in South Sami		=			
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the South Sami language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of South Sami	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of South Sami in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in South Sami	=				

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Norway concerning South Sami ¹⁷	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
		12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in South Sami		=	
12.2	In territories other than those in which South Sami is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using South Sami					=
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Sami and the culture it reflects					=
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of South Sami		=			
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in South Sami				=	
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.b	for the benefit of South Sami, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory South Sami is used in identical or similar form	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

38. The Norwegian authorities decided to close down the primary school in Elgå, one of the two schools in Norway providing education in South Sami, due to the low number of children. The efforts of the speakers to maintain the school resulted merely in a delay of the closing by one year. (Article 8.1.biv)

2.7.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of South Sami in Norway

The Committee of Experts encourages the Norwegian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.7.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Norway has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Norway¹⁷ remain valid in their own right.

¹⁷ RecChL(2001)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016804dce9d);
 RecChL(2003)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805df248);
 CM/RecChL(2007)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805afe1b);
 CM/RecChL(2010)2 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805cf75c);
 CM/RecChL(2012)8 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c9276);
 CM/RecChL(2015)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c2ba9).

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. Provide forms and means for the teaching and study of South Sami at all appropriate stages, including by distance learning, and with sufficient capacity and availability, including teacher training and teaching materials, at least at pre-school and primary level.**
- b. Encourage the use of spoken and written South Sami in education, media as well as in cultural activities.**
- c. Ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals and retirement homes offer services in South Sami.**

II. Further recommendations

- d. Take resolute action to raise awareness about South Sami as a minority language in Norway and facilitate its recognition in education, teacher training and media as an expression of cultural wealth.
- e. Provide facilities enabling non-speakers, including adult non-speakers, of South Sami to learn it.
- f. Ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not create obstacles for the promotion of South Sami.
- g. Offer South Sami as a subject in adult and continuing education.
- h. Ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by South Sami.
- i. In territories other than those in which South Sami is traditionally used, extend teaching in or of South Sami at all appropriate stages of education.
- j. Continue efforts to use or adopt additional place names in South Sami, in co-operation with the speakers.
- k. Enhance the offer of media programmes and printed media production in South Sami.

Chapter 3 Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe¹⁸

The Committee of Experts, while acknowledging the efforts the Norwegian authorities have undertaken to protect the regional and minority languages spoken in their country, has in its evaluation chosen to concentrate on some of the most important deficiencies in the implementation of the Charter. The recommendations forwarded by the Committee of Experts to the Committee of Ministers should not, however, be interpreted as diminishing the relevance of the other, more detailed observations contained in the report, which remain valid in their own right. The recommendations proposed by the Committee of Experts are drafted accordingly.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, in accordance with Article 16 (4) of the Charter, proposes on the basis of the information contained in this report, that the Committee of Ministers makes the following recommendations to Norway.

The Committee of Ministers,

In accordance with Article 16 of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages;

Having regard to the instrument of ratification deposited by Norway on 10 November 1993;

Having taken note of the evaluation made by the Committee of Experts of the Charter with respect to the application of the Charter by Norway;

Having taken note of the comments submitted by the Norwegian authorities on the content of the Committee of Experts' report, including on the scope of application of Part II and Part III of the Charter, and that the Government of Norway is about to start a process for reviewing whether it is feasible to include additional languages under Part III of the Charter, in accordance with the procedure provided for in Article 3, paragraph 2;

Bearing in mind that this evaluation is based on information submitted by Norway in its 7th periodical report, supplementary information provided by the Norwegian authorities, information submitted by bodies and associations legally established in Norway and the information obtained by the Committee of Experts during its on-the-spot visit,

Recommends that the Norwegian authorities take account of all the observations and recommendations of the Committee of Experts and, as a matter of priority:

1. implement a structured policy for Kven/Finnish, giving priority to offering education and a stronger presence in the broadcast media;
2. protect and promote Lule Sami and South Sami in education and media;
3. promote services in all Sami languages in hospitals and retirement homes;
4. develop a strategy and take proactive measures to promote Romani and Romanes, in co-operation with the speakers;
5. provide for the teaching and study of Romani and Romanes at all appropriate levels.

¹⁸ As adopted by the Ministers' Deputies at their 1321st meeting (4 July 2018, CM/Del/Dec(2018)1321/10.2)

Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification

Norway

Declarations contained in the instrument of ratification, deposited on 10 November 1993 - Or. Engl.

We undertake to carry out the provisions contained in Parts I, II, IV and V of the Charter and also in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 2, the provisions contained in the following articles, paragraphs and sub-paragraphs of Part III of the Charter:

In Article 8:

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (iii), b (iv), c (iv), d (iv), e (ii), f (ii), g, h, i
Paragraph 2

In Article 9:

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i-iv), b (i-iii), d
Paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a
Paragraph 3

In Article 10:

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (iii), b, c
Paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d, e, f, g
Paragraph 3, sub-paragraph b
Paragraph 4, sub-paragraph a
Paragraph 5

In Article 11:

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs, a (iii), b (i), c (ii), e (i), f (ii), g
Paragraph 2

In Article 12:

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, d, e, f, g, h
Paragraph 2
Paragraph 3

In Article 13:

Paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs c, e

In Article 14:

sub-paragraph b.

The above-mentioned paragraphs and sub-paragraphs shall, in accordance with Article 3, paragraph 1, apply to the Sami language.

Period covered: 1/3/1998 -

The preceding statement concerns Article(s): 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 2, 3, 8, 9

Appendix II: Comments from the Norwegian authorities

The Norwegian government appreciates the opportunity to comment on the Expert Committee's seventh evaluation report on Norway's implementation of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages.

Summary

In the most recent monitoring cycles, the Committee of Experts, and on one occasion, the Committee of Ministers, has recommend that Norway clarify the status of the Lule Sami and South Sami languages under the Charter. Therefore, Norway has clarified that status of these languages where appropriate, and we are doing so in these comments as well. It remains clear, both from Norway's instrument of ratification, clarifications in State reports as well as the absence of any subsequent Norwegian notification regarding undertakings for the South Sami and/or the Lule Sami languages, that Norway's obligations under Part III of the Charter only apply to the North Sami language. The South Sami language and the Lule Sami language are both covered by Part II of the Charter. Accordingly, Norway will continue to apply Part III of the Charter only to the North Sami language. This will remain the case until Norway, potentially, decides to take on, in accordance with Article 3 of the Charter, specific undertakings under Part III for any other minority language. Norway invites the Committee of Experts and the Committee of Ministers to apply the Charter in the same manner.

Norway has also been asked to clarify the status of the Kven and Finnish languages. We will therefore take this opportunity to make clear that Norway will continue to apply Part II of the Charter to the Kven language, and that we do not consider Finnish as a language covered by the Charter. We invite the Committee of Experts and the Committee of Ministers to take note of this clarification and apply the Charter in the same manner. This would include amending recommendation no. 1 in the draft resolution, as proposed from the Committee of Experts.

These clarifications mean that the Charter continues to apply to the following minority languages in Norway:

- ***North Sami (part II and III)***
- ***Lule Sami (part II)***
- ***South Sami (part II)***
- ***Kven (part II)***
- ***Romanes (part II, as a non-territorial language)***
- ***Romani (part II, as a non-territorial language)***

Draft preambular paragraphs to the resolution from the Committee of Ministers

We invite the Committee of Ministers to include information on comments made in this appendix, in the preambular part of the resolution on the follow-up of the Charter. Such preambular paragraphs might be worded as follows:

Having taken note of the comments submitted by the Norwegian authorities on the content of the Committee of Experts' report, including on the scope of application of Part II and Part III of the Charter;

Acknowledging that, with respect to Norway, Part III of the Charter currently applies to the North Sami language, and that part II of the Charter applies to the North Sami, Lule Sami, South Sami, Kven, Romanes and Romani languages;

Welcoming that the Government of Norway is about to start a process for reviewing whether it is feasible to include the South Sami, Lule Sami and/or Kven languages under Part III of the Charter, as provided for in Article 3, paragraph 2;

1. The legal scope of the Charter

1.1. The Lule Sami and South Sami languages

The Committee of Experts appears to assume, in paragraph 7 of the report, that the South Sami and Lule Sami languages in Norway should be considered as covered under Part III of the Charter, even though Norway has not undertaken to apply Part III of the Charter with respect to these languages, neither in the instrument of ratification nor in any subsequent notification. In addition, the Committee of Experts appears to imply that *all* the 53 undertakings within Part III of the Charter declared by Norway for the North Sami language, should also be applied to the South Sami and Lule Sami languages, even though the situation for the latter, much less frequently used languages, is substantially quite different.

The Committee of Experts has reached this position in contradiction to Norway's declaration in the instrument of ratification, and in contradiction to the clarifications made by Norway in our most recent state reports. The Committee of Experts' arguments for this view is not included in the report.

Norway ratified the Charter in 1993. After careful consideration, and in conformity with Article 2 and 3 of the Charter, Norway specified 53 undertakings under Part III for the North Sami language – conventionally referred to at the time as "the Sami language". At the time of ratification the national legislation corresponding to the obligations under Part III of the Charter, was already in force. At the time, those provisions applied only to the North Sami language. It was therefore clearly not the intention of the Government of Norway to ratify the same 53 undertakings for the Lule Sami and South Sami languages. The same conclusion also follows from the documents that were drawn up in Norway in preparation of the ratification in 1993, including the Royal Decree authorizing the ratification. The ratification instrument speaks of only one language, "the Sami language", in singular. Read in its legal and linguistic context, it is clearly the language now generally referred to as *North Sami*. Furthermore, Norway has not subsequently notified any undertakings for the South Sami and/or the Lule Sami languages under Part III of the Charter, as provided for in Article 3, paragraph 2.

In addition, at some time after the charter was ratified, Norway clarified that South Sami and Lule Sami are to be considered as separate minority languages, and not as varieties of one Sami language. This is in accordance with the wishes of the language users. Consequently, all three languages are now protected, separately, under part II of the Charter.

The status of North Sami as a Part III language, and Lule Sami and South Sami as Part II languages under the Charter, is well known by the language users, through Norway's State reports and official documents from the Norwegian Government, including the review of the language provisions in the Sami act that was concluded in 2013, and published in 2014¹⁹. This legal understanding by the Norwegian government is also the basis for the recommendations from the Sami language committee (NOU 2016: 18 Hjertespråket²⁰), in, *inter alia*, chapter 6.4. The language committee recommended that the government of Norway undertake to expand the scope of Part III, through a notification to the Council of Europe, in order to include the South Sami language and the Lule Sami language (appendix one, subchapter 4.8).

During the fifth monitoring cycle Norway was asked by the Committee of Ministers to clarify the status of the Lule Sami and South Sami languages under the Charter (Recommendation CM/RecChL(2012)8). Norway clarified in the sixth state report that Norway has not made undertakings for the Lule Sami and South Sami languages under Part III of the Charter. We are aware that the Committee of Experts has made note of an unclear structure in the earliest state reports from Norway, creating doubt, on the part of the Committee of Experts, regarding the status of the South Sami and Lule Sami languages. Norway has, in some earlier state reports, given information about all three Sami languages at the same place in the state report. This has typically been done when the same or very similar measures or legal provisions are in place for all three languages, in order to avoid a lengthier document than necessary. However, an ambiguous wording or an unclear structure in a state report cannot create new legal obligations for a State party. Furthermore, the clarifications made in later state reports necessarily supersede any ambiguities in the earlier state reports. The position of the Norwegian Government was made clear in our comments to the sixth periodic report of the Committee of Experts, transferred in our letter of 16 June 2015, and presented to the Committee of Ministers to its 1235th meeting in September 2015 as appendix II to the report from the Committee of Experts (CM(2015)123).

¹⁹ The document can be retrieved from the government website here (in Norwegian):

https://www.regjeringen.no/globalassets/upload/kmd/sami/same/gjennomgang_av_samelovens_sprakregler.pdf

²⁰ The document can be retrieved from the government website here (in Norwegian): <https://www.regjeringen.no/no/dokumenter/nou-2016-18/id2515222/>

It therefore remains clear, both from the instrument of ratification, clarifications in state reports as well as the absence of any subsequent Norwegian notification regarding undertakings for the South Sami and/or the Lule Sami languages, that Norway's obligations under Part III of the Charter only apply to the North Sami language. Norway will accordingly continue to apply Part III of the Charter only to the North Sami language and invites the Committee of Ministers and the Committee of Experts to do so as well.

We also invite the Committee of Ministers to include information on the clarifications made in these comments in the preambular part of the resolution on Norway's follow-up of the Charter. Draft preambular paragraphs on the topic are included above, after the summary.

1.2. The Kven language and the Finnish language

The Committee of Experts states, in paragraph 10, that it will deal with Kven and Finnish separately. This is also reflected in the Executive Summary, where the Committee of Experts holds that "The Charter applies to Finnish, Kven [...]". This means that the Committee of Experts appears to have established a practice in contradiction to the clarifications made in Norway's recent reports and in our dialogue with the Committee throughout the regular monitoring cycles. The Committee of Experts' arguments for this view are not clear from the report.

When Norway submitted the first periodical report in 1999, Kven/Finnish was recognised as a *minority language* under the Charter. The Government's reason for using the double designation was that both Kven and Finnish were used as names for the same language by the language users themselves.

In 2001 the Committee of Ministers adopted a recommendation (Recommendation RecChL(2001)5) requesting the Norwegian authorities to clarify the status of Kven as to whether it is a dialect of the Finnish language or a separate language on its own. Professor Kenneth Hyltenstam at the University of Stockholm carried out a comprehensive study on this issue. As a consequence, Kven was recognised as a language, by Royal Decree in 2005. Since then, Kven has been recognised under the Charter as one of the regional or minority languages in Norway.

In 2010 The Norwegian-Finnish Association requested the Government to recognise Finnish as a separate minority language in Norway, under the Charter. The Government concluded that Kven is the language that has traditionally been used by the national minority known as Kvens or Norwegian-Finns, and that the modern Finnish language, i.e. the official language used in Finland, does not fall within the scope of the Charter's definition of minority and regional languages. This conclusion was reached with a view to the wording of Article 1 (a) of the Charter ('traditionally used'), in addition to statements in the Explanatory Report to the Charter regarding 'languages which have been *spoken*' (our emphasis). The Charter is consequently not applicable to modern Finnish. There are, however, national measures targeting even the Finnish language, including provisions regarding instruction in schools, which benefit the entire Kven/Norwegian-Finnish minority. The Charter places no limitations on the State as regards measures to promote languages other than those covered by the Charter.

In conclusion, Kven is now the official name of the traditional minority language formerly named Kven/Finnish. At the same time, the members of the Kven/Norwegian-Finnish minority are free to use any name they wish on their own language. In accordance with Article 1 of the Charter, Norway will continue to apply the Charter to the Kven language, and not the modern Finnish language. We invite the Committee of Ministers and the Committee of Experts to take note of this clarification and apply the Charter in the same manner, in the upcoming monitoring cycles.

We also invite the Committee of Ministers to amend recommendation no. 1 in the proposal from the Committee of Experts, so that it is consistent with the clarifications Norway has made, as requested by the Committee of Ministers, so that it speaks of the Kven language only.

2. Recent developments and factual corrections

2.1. Consideration of Part III for the South Sami, Lule Sami and Kven languages

As we informed the Committee of Experts during the on-the-spot-visit in October 2017, we are already in the process of evaluating whether it is feasible to include the South Sami, Lule Sami and Kven languages under Part III of the Charter. Administrative resources have been set aside in the Ministry of Local Government and Modernisation in 2018 to start evaluating the question. The matter requires careful consideration of each single possible undertaking, for each specific language. It is, however, clear at the outset, that any possible set of undertakings for the Lule Sami, South Sami and Kven languages would be fewer than the 53 undertakings we have committed to for the North Sami language. One of the reasons for this is the lower number of speakers.

2.2. On special characters in public registers

In the Executive Summary paragraph 4, the Committee of Experts states: "Difficulties persist with the use of special characters in public registers in North Sami and Lule Sami". The difficulties are, however, with the use of special characters in North Sami and *South Sami*.

2.3. On the use of the minority languages in education, para. 12

There are two schools providing technical and vocational education in Sami language. One in Karasjok and one in Kautokeino. The report states that there is only one.

2.4. On the situation of Skolt Sami/Eastern Sami, para. 18

The measures to revitalise the Skolt Sami/Eastern Sami language, mentioned in paragraph 18, which aims at revitalising the Skolt Sami/Eastern Sami language, are done in co-operation with Finland and *with participants from Russia*.

2.5. On Sami languages, para. 29

It is stated in para. 29 that: "Funding is also problematic, as it is not covered by the Norwegian government and depends on the decisions and the finances of the municipality." We will therefore clarify that the Government grants funds to the municipalities for extra expenses for instruction in and on South Sami, in the same manner as for instruction in and on Lule Sami and North Sami.

2.6. References to Kven vs. Finnish, para. 31

In paragraph 31 there is an erroneous reference to the development of a "targeted plan for the Finnish language". The Ministry of Local Government and Modernisation, in co-operation with the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Culture, presented a targeted plan to revitalize Kven language, in January 2018.

The purpose of the Government's plan and Troms County's plan is the same, to strengthen the *Kven* language.

The scientific event in 2016, mentioned in paragraph 31, was an input event to prepare the Government's targeted plan on the *Kven* language.