
1156 Meeting, 28 November 2012

10 Legal questions

10.3 European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages –

b. Fifth report of the Committee of Experts in respect of Norway

Item to be considered by the GR-J at its meeting on 20 November 2012

In accordance with Article 16, paragraph 3 of the Charter, the Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages submits its fifth report on the application of the Charter in Norway to the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe. The report contains proposals for recommendations to be addressed by the Committee of Ministers to Norway. The Norwegian government has been given the opportunity to comment on the content, in accordance with Article 16, paragraph 3 of the Charter.

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages provides for a control mechanism to evaluate how the Charter is applied in a State Party with a view to, where necessary, making recommendations for improving its legislation, policy and practices. The central element of this procedure is the Committee of Experts, set up under Article 17 of the Charter. Its principal purpose is to report to the Committee of Ministers on its evaluation of compliance by a Party with its undertakings, to examine the real situation of regional or minority languages in the State and, where appropriate, to encourage the Party to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

To facilitate this task, the Committee of Ministers adopted, in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 1, an outline for periodical reports that a Party is required to submit to the Secretary General. The report should be made public by the State. This outline requires the State to give an account of the concrete application of the Charter, the general policy for the languages protected under Part II and, in more precise terms, all measures that have been taken in application of the provisions chosen for each language protected under Part III of the Charter. The Committee's first task is therefore to examine the information contained in the periodical report for all the relevant regional or minority languages on the territory of the State concerned.

The Committee's role is to evaluate the existing legal acts, regulations and real practice applied in each State for its regional or minority languages. It has established its working methods accordingly. The Committee gathers information from the respective authorities and from independent sources within the State, with a view to obtaining a fair and just overview of the real language situation. After a preliminary examination of a periodical report, the Committee submits, if necessary, a number of questions to each Party concerned on matters it considers unclear or insufficiently developed in the report itself. This written procedure is usually followed up by an "on-the-spot visit" by a delegation of the Committee to the respective State. During this visit the delegation meets bodies and associations whose work is closely related to the use of the relevant languages, and consults the authorities on matters that have been brought to its attention. This information-gathering process is designed to enable the Committee of Experts to evaluate more effectively the application of the Charter in the State concerned.

Having concluded this process, the Committee of Experts adopts its own report. This report is submitted to the Committee of Ministers, together with suggestions for recommendations that the latter may decide to address to the State Party.

¹ This document has been classified restricted at the date of issue. In accordance with the Deputies' decision (CM/Del/Dec(2001)765/10.4), it will be declassified after examination by the Committee of Ministers.

CONTENTS

Chapter 1 - Background information	3
1.1 Ratification of the Charter by Norway	3
1.2 The work of the Committee of Experts	3
1.3 Presentation of the regional or minority language situation in Norway: up-date	3
1.4 Particular issues arising from the evaluation of the report	4
Chapter 2 - Conclusions of the Committee of Experts on how the State authorities have reacted to the recommendations of the Committee of Ministers (RecChL(2010)2)	5
Chapter 3 - The Committee of Experts' evaluation in respect of Parts II and III of the Charter	7
3.1. Evaluation in respect of Part II of the Charter	7
3.2. Evaluation in respect of Part III of the Charter	23
Chapter 4 – Findings and proposals for recommendations	33
4.1. Findings of the Committee of Experts in the fifth monitoring cycle	33
4.2. Proposals for recommendations on the basis of the results of the fifth monitoring cycle	34
Appendix I: Instrument of ratification	36
Appendix II: Comments by the Norwegian authorities	37

Chapter 1 - Background information

1.1. Ratification of the Charter by Norway

1. Norway signed the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereafter referred to as “the Charter”) on 5 November 1992 and deposited its instrument of ratification on 10 November 1993. The Charter entered into force in Norway on 1 March 1998.
2. Article 15.1 of the Charter requires States Parties to submit three-yearly reports in a form prescribed by the Committee of Ministers. The Norwegian authorities were expected to present their fifth periodical report to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe on 1 July 2011 and they presented it on 2 January 2012. The report has been made public.

1.2. The work of the Committee of Experts

3. This fifth evaluation report is based on the information obtained by the Committee of Experts from the fifth periodical report of Norway, as well as through interviews held with representatives of the regional or minority languages in Norway and the Norwegian authorities during the “on-the-spot” visit, which took place from 16-18 April 2012. During the on-the-spot-visit, a delegation from the Committee of Experts met with Kven, North Sámi, Lule Sámi, South Sámi, Romani, Romanes and Finnish NGOs. The delegation had no chance to meet with representatives of Skolt Sámi. In accordance with Article 16 paragraph 2 of the Charter, the Committee of Experts also received several comments from bodies and associations legally established in Norway.
4. The present report focuses on the measures taken by the Norwegian authorities to respond to the recommendations of the Committee of Experts and the Committee of Ministers of the fourth monitoring cycle. This report also highlights new issues, which the Committee of Experts considers to be of particular importance in the context of this fifth monitoring cycle.
5. The present report contains detailed observations which the Norwegian authorities are encouraged to take into account when developing their policy on regional or minority languages. On the basis of these detailed observations, the Committee of Experts has also established a list of general proposals for the preparation of a fifth set of recommendations to be addressed to Norway by the Committee of Ministers, as provided in Article 16, paragraph 4 of the Charter. The present report reflects the policies, legislation and practice prevailing at the time of the on-the-spot visit. Any changes after that time will be taken into account in the next report of the Committee of Experts concerning Norway.
6. The present report was adopted by the Committee of Experts on 19 June 2012.

1.3. Presentation of the regional or minority language situation in Norway: up-date

7. The languages on the territory of Norway which are protected under the Charter are the Sámi languages (North, South, Lule and Eastern Sámi/Skolt Sámi), Kven and the two non-territorial languages, Romani and Romanes. The Committee of Experts refers to the relevant paragraphs of the first and second evaluation reports for the general presentation of the situation of these languages in Norway (ECRML (2001) 6 paragraphs 7-17 and ECRML (2003) 2 paragraphs 9-21).
8. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities mention that there has been a demand from the Finnish speakers to have Finnish protected under part II of the Charter. According to the authorities, the matter is being considered by the Ministry of Government Administration, Reform and Church Affairs. The Committee of Experts looks forward to information on this aspect in the next periodical report.
9. As already mentioned in the third evaluation report on Norway and repeated in the fourth evaluation report, it is important to have reliable data concerning the number of users of regional or minority languages and their geographic distribution. The Norwegian authorities provide only rough estimates of the numbers of speakers of regional or minority languages in Norway. The reason for this is the reluctance to register persons based on their ethnicity. With regard to Sámi languages, the Norwegian authorities mention however that “[i]n the spring of 2011, the Ministry of Government Administration, Reform and Church Affairs, the Ministry of Education and Research and Sámi Parliament took the initiative to carry out a major language survey to assess the language situation at an individual level among the Sámi population”. The report has not yet been published.

10. In the fifth periodical report, the authorities mention that “there has [also] been talk of finding a way of obtaining better basic data when it comes to Kvens/Norwegian Finns, although no solution concerning how this work could be structured has been found so far. The Kvenland Federation (Kvenlandsforbundet) pointed out during the report's public hearing that they wanted the language situation for Finnish and Kven surveyed at an individual level, but they do not want registration based on ethnicity. The authorities' assessment is that such a survey would be extremely challenging in terms of methodology”.

11. As far as Pite Sámi is concerned, although this language is considered to be extinct (fifth periodical report), the authorities mention the activities that have been undertaken in view of revitalizing the language: -“Duoddara Ráffe Pite Sámi center is working to revitalize the Pite Sámi language and culture. In 2010, the centre was awarded funds from the Ministry of Government Administration, Reform and Church Affairs to operate information and course activities on the Pite Sámi language and culture”. -“Sámediggi [the Sámi Parliament] has delegated responsibility for Pite Sámi museum activities to Árran - lulesami center. The Ministry of Government Administration, Reform and Church Affairs has granted Árran - lulesami center funds for a three-year project ending in 2012. The aim of the project is to help preserve, promote and revitalise the use of Sámi place names in the Pite Sámi area”.

12. The Committee of Experts encourages the Norwegian authorities to continue its work to produce more reliable data on language use, especially in regard to Kven speakers, in co-operation with the speakers.

1.4. Particular issues arising from the evaluation of the report

Kven

13. The Committee of Experts has been informed that despite the measures taken by the authorities since the last monitoring round, the Kven language remains in a very precarious situation. The Committee of Experts notes that the process of standardisation is ongoing and encourages the authorities to continue their efforts. However, measures are needed to promote the language in the meantime, such as providing for Kven in education, including adult education, and strengthening its position in broadcasting and literature. Particular attention should be paid to develop its positions in education.

The status of Lule and South Sámi languages

14. The Sámi Act defines the Sámi Administrative District as an area where the concentration of Sámi-speakers justifies special measures. This area included from the outset the municipalities of Karasjok, Kautokeino, Nesseby, Porsanger, Tana and Kåfjord. The Committee of Experts has in its previous reports considered the Sámi Administrative District as the area where Part III applies. In 2009 Lavangen municipality also became a part of the Sámi Administrative District. This municipality, in which North Sámi is spoken, is geographically isolated from the other North Sámi municipalities. Particular attention will therefore be paid to it. Tysfjord municipality (where Lule Sámi is used) has been included in the Sámi Administrative District since 2006 and the municipality of Snåsa (where South Sámi is used) since 2008. The question therefore has arisen whether Part III should also apply to the new areas included in the Sámi Administrative District, which would also mean that Lule and South Sámi would consequently become “Part III languages”.

15. In their fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities stated that “[t]he Ministry of Government Administration, Reform and Church Affairs has started a review of the Sámi Act's language rules as one of the measures in the Action Plan for Sámi Languages [...]. In connection with this, an assessment of the status of Lule Sámi and South Sámi in relation to the Charter's Part III will be carried out. Norwegian authorities will get back to the Council of Europe with information on this as soon as the issue has reached a conclusion.”

16. This question arose during the fourth monitoring cycle and has not been solved during the fifth monitoring round. The Committee of Experts recalls the fourth cycle recommendation of the Committee of Ministers on the matter and reiterates its encouragements to the Norwegian authorities to “[c]larify the status of the Lule and South Sámi languages in relation to Part III of the Charter” and to notify the Council of Europe in the appropriate manner.

17. With reference to the presentation above, the Committee of Experts has decided to deal with Lule Sámi and South Sámi in this report under Part II.

Chapter 2 - Conclusions of the Committee of Experts on how the State authorities have reacted to the recommendations of the Committee of Ministers (RecChL(2010)2)

Recommendation No.1:

“Ensure that social and health care institutions within the Sámi Administrative District offer services in North Sámi”.

18. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that the problems identified in the previous rounds regarding the use of North Sámi in the health sector are on their way to be solved. The authorities report on various measures that have been taken in this sphere, amongst them the transformation of the teaching nursing home in Karasjok into a national teaching nursing home for the Sámi population, courses for health staff in the autumn of 2010 with an emphasis on teaching Sámi language and culture, the development of a mental health care service for the Sámi population in Norway by National Sámi Competence Centre mental health care (SANKS), and that a special Sámi scheme is being implemented under the Directorate of Health's dementia programme.

19. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was furthermore informed by the authorities that the Norwegian Directorate of Health has initiated a three-year programme on increasing the quality of care for the elderly, that a hospital in the County of Finnmark has introduced a compulsory two-day Sámi language training course for health staff and that a project on how to use new technologies such as video conferences to increase the quality of the health care is supported by the authorities. The Committee of Experts however understands that many municipalities where Sámi is used are small and peripheral, causing recruitment difficulties and a high turnover and instability of staff. This has *per se* an impact on the health service and indirectly affects Sámi speakers.

Recommendation No.2:

“Clarify the status of the Lule and South Sámi languages in relation to Part III of the Charter”.

20. A review of the Sámi Act's language rules as one of the measures in the Action Plan for Sámi Languages has been started. In connection with this, an assessment of the status of Lule Sámi and South Sámi in relation to the Charter's Part III will be carried out. Norwegian authorities will provide the Council of Europe with information on this as soon as the issue has reached a conclusion.

Recommendation No.3:

“Continue their efforts to provide teaching in/of Lule and South Sámi, including the development of teaching materials and teacher training”.

Teaching material

21. In June 2010, a working group presented a report with proposals for measures for more efficient development and production of Sámi teaching materials, including separate measures for South Sámi and Lule Sámi teaching aids. The County Governor of Nordland also operates a network for South Sámi teachers, which focuses on the needs of these teachers and the challenges they face. The County Governor has also developed a database for educational material in South Sámi, and has granted funds for the completion of *Samasta*, which is a 'computer based' course in Lule Sámi.

Language training for teachers

22. The focus by the authorities has been on improving language training for South and Lule Sámi teachers. Highly qualified teachers from Scotland and Israel have been invited to teach South Sámi teachers efficient language training techniques.

Distance education

23. Courses on distance education with a view to improving teachers' competence in this field have been organised and Drag School in Tysfjord has been developed into a resource centre for Lule Sámi distance education, where the target groups are primary and lower secondary school pupils all over the country who are entitled to education in Lule Sámi. The resource centre is currently working to capacity and seems to be in need of more teachers.

24. The Directorate for Education and Training, in co-operation with the county governors of Nordland and Finnmark, is continuing its work on the plan for Sámi distance education to ensure the service maintains a high level of quality and also satisfies the demand.

Recommendation No.4:

“Continue their efforts to protect and promote the Kven language in particular in education and in the field of broadcast media”.

25. In the fifth periodical report, the authorities present a number of measures taken to promote Kven and Finnish in education.

26. Pupils with Kven or Finnish backgrounds in primary and lower secondary schools in Troms and Finnmark are entitled to learn Finnish as a second language when at least three pupils request this. Tuition can be provided in Kven.

27. In the 2010/2011 school year, 754 pupils in primary and lower secondary schools were given lessons in Finnish as a second language. It is not recorded whether the lessons are in Finnish as a second language or Kven. Lessons in Kven may be given if the children/parents request this. At the upper secondary level there are 24 pupils in Finnmark and two pupils in Troms who receive lessons in Finnish.

28. A new curriculum for Finnish as a second language includes both the Kven and Finnish languages, as well as Kven and Finnish culture. This curriculum has been established in co-operation with the Kven speakers. The curriculum is based on the European framework and has the same structure as other language training. Grants are provided for training and for study authorisation for teachers. There is also a goal to provide tuition in Finnish as a second language to pupils and apprentices with Finnish or Kven backgrounds in upper secondary education. Grants are provided to county authorities and private schools that provide such tuition as well as for the development of teaching materials in Kven. As far as adult education is concerned, no special measures have been taken to promote Kven, beyond the courses in Kven at the university of Tromsø and Finnmark University College. The authorities also mention that the Kven Institute offers local courses for adults.

29. Where Kven in broadcasting is concerned, the Norwegian authorities recognise the insufficient amount of broadcasting in the Kven language and the Minister of Culture, via Norwegian Broadcasting Corporation's (NRK's) general assembly, has “demanded that this must be pursued”.

Recommendation No.5:

“Take measures to develop language education in Romani and Romanes in co-operation with the speakers”.

30. In the fifth periodical report, the authorities present the recent actions taken to develop language education in Romani and Romanes. They underline that they have never received any requests for language tuition in Romanes or Romani.

Romanes

31. In co-operation with a Roma association, Romani Kultura, a scheme has been established for primary and lower secondary schools that wish to use Romanes-speaking first language assistants. The initiative came from Roma mothers who have fully or partially completed upper secondary school in Sweden. In January 2011, a course for bilingual kindergarten assistants was started at Oslo University College in which assistants with Roma backgrounds will participate. Norway has also started a collaboration with Sweden on online resources for first language tuition (<http://modersmal.skolverket.se/romani/>). As of 2011, the website www.morsmal.no is administered by the National Centre for Multicultural Education. The Swedish website includes several variants of Romanes. These have been tested for adult education in Sweden.

Romani

32. Funds have been granted for language measures. The organisations for the Romani people/Taters have received project funds for collecting words and developing a Romani dictionary. At the public hearing it was stated that this was a necessary part of the preliminary work before it would be possible to start language tuition. During the on-the-spot visit, the representatives of the Taters mentioned a project aiming at collecting stories from old travellers and transcribing them. The transcribed text will then be used to develop a written standard. The Committee of Experts did not receive information of any Romani education taking place at present.

Chapter 3 - The Committee of Experts' evaluation in respect of Parts II and III of the Charter*General remarks*

33. The Committee of Experts will focus its evaluation on the provisions of Parts II and III of the Charter which were specifically outlined as problematical in the Committee of Expert's previous evaluation report. It will not comment on provisions in relation to which no major issues were raised in its first, second, third and fourth reports and for which it did not receive any new information requiring a revised assessment. The Committee of Experts does, however, reserve the right to carry out at a later stage a new comprehensive evaluation of the implementation of Parts II and III of the Charter.

3.1. Evaluation in respect of Part II of the Charter

34. In the present evaluation report, the Committee of Experts will not comment on Article 7.1.b.

Article 7 - Objectives and principles*Paragraph 1*

In respect of regional or minority languages, within the territories in which such languages are used and according to the situation of each language, the Parties shall base their policies, legislation and practice on the following objectives and principles:

- a. the recognition of the regional or minority languages as an expression of cultural wealth;***

Kven

35. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts noted that although public authorities had supported Kven and the culture that it reflects, Kven speakers had not been consulted by the authorities and that there was room for improvement in that respect.

36. As indicated by the authorities in the fifth periodical report, support mainly of a financial type is provided by the authorities for the development of the language. The authorities also mention that two Kven organisations were consulted for the drafting of the periodical report.

37. During the on-the-spot visit, the representatives of the Kven-speakers expressed the wish to establish a permanent constructive dialogue with the authorities, in order for the authorities to acquire a better understanding of their needs. They also mentioned the lack of information on minority issues and for instance information on where to send different applications. They underlined the long delays in receiving answers from the authorities to questions sent to them.

Romani/ Romanes

38. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts invited the authorities to clarify whether the mandate of the Romani People's Funds also covers language matters and whether projects on developing books and material on the language could be supported.

39. In their fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that the purpose of the funds is to support initiatives and activities that promote the protection and development of the Romani people's/Taters' culture, language and history. As far as the fund's contributions in 2011 are concerned, the board has decided that tuition in and dissemination of the Romani language will be one of two priority areas.

40. The Norwegian authorities mentioned that in 2011, the fund supported 17 projects with a total of 942 780 NOK.

c. the need for resolute action to promote regional or minority languages in order to safeguard them;

Kven

41. During the fourth monitoring round the Committee of Experts noted that despite the actions taken by the authorities to promote Kven, the situation on the ground had not changed and the language was still in a very precarious situation. The Committee of Experts invited the authorities to comment on the wish of the Kven speakers to develop and reinforce a second cultural centre, Kveenibaikka.

42. The Committee of Experts also invited the authorities to provide information on the follow-up to the measures listed in the White Paper on language policy:

- the Ministry will continue its work to protect and promote the Kven language;
- the Ministry will consider inviting representatives of the Kven speakers, all relevant ministries and representatives from relevant professional/academic professions/institutions to a national conference on the revitalisation of the Kven language;
- the Ministry will discuss with responsible instances how the *Ruijan Kaiku* publication can be developed and strengthened;
- the Ministry will create conditions to intensify the work of gathering and registering [Sámi and] Kven place names;
- the Ministry will, when considering the economy and mandate of the Kven Institute, especially bear in mind the need to intensify the work on the standardisation of the Kven language.

43. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that a pilot project, providing those who are about to learn the language with extended opportunities to participate in a language environment where the language is in living use, is being funded by the Ministry of Culture (a 2009 grant). This project is a collaboration between Skibotn kvenforening, Kveenibaikka kultursenter and the Kvenland Federation.

44. The authorities mention the financing of the "Kven names on the internet and map" project of the Varanger Museum IKS and the existence of the Kven newspaper *Ruijan Kaiku* that also benefits from public funding. Another measure mentioned by the authorities is the expansion of the activities of the Language Council of Norway, which will be responsible for national minority languages. The authorities also report that a Conference on the revitalization of the Kven language was organised in June 2010 by the national government, and attended by representatives of several ministries.

45. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed that the Language Council of Norway has not yet started its work on the Kven language and that the Conference on the revitalization of the Kven language has not led to any concrete measures yet. The Ministry of Education, however, assured the Committee of Experts that the Conference will soon have a follow-up and the project was not off the agenda. The Committee of Experts looks forward to receiving information in this respect in the next periodical report.

46. Regarding the standardisation of the Kven language, the authorities mention that "[t]here is disagreement between the different organisations in the group as to whether work on standardisation is the right direction, as a large proportion of the minorities use the Finnish written language and thus already have a written language". The authorities however mention the funding of the Kven Institute, which is working on the development, documentation and communication of knowledge on the Kven language and culture. This Institute works *inter alia* on the standardisation of the Kven language and has succeeded in developing spelling rules and adopting a set of grammatical norms.

47. The Committee of Experts was informed during the on-the-spot visit that the work is in progress and that a grammar is due to be completed in the course of 2013. The Kven Institute has been awarded a 3% increase in the proposed National Budget for 2012, but this is, according to the speakers, not sufficient to fulfil its responsibilities as a national institute for the Kven language.

48. The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities to continue their efforts on the standardisation of the Kven language and looks forward to receiving information on the follow-up to the Conference on the revitalization of the Kven language. The Committee of Experts has also been informed about the work presently being carried out in Sweden regarding the standardisation of Meänkieli. It believes it would be beneficial to the work on the standardisation of Kven to establish contacts with the same type of work going on in regard to Meänkieli.

Romani/ Romanes

49. In the previous evaluation report, although the Committee of Experts recognised the successful measures taken regarding the education of Roma children, it noted that there was no teaching of Romani. The Committee of Experts “urge[d] the authorities to intensify their efforts to protect and promote Romani and Romanes languages, in co-operation with the speakers, especially in the field of education”.

50. In their fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that there has been no demand for tuition in Romani in public schools but that grants have been made to the Romani people's/Taters' organisations for language courses. The authorities also mention some funding to the Taters' Association of Norway (*Taternes Landsforening*) that took place in 2007 and 2009 and the current support to the *Landsorganisasjonen for Romanifolket* (LOR), a Romani organisation, for the work aiming at encouraging young members to learn the Romani language. The authorities added that when children are placed in foster families, their linguistic and cultural backgrounds are taken into consideration. The action plan to improve the living conditions for the Roma people includes child welfare measures.

51. The Committee of Experts noted during the on-the-spot visit that there was an interest among the representatives of Romani/Romanes speakers as regards teaching of Romani/Romanes. It welcomes the measures taken and looks forward to receiving precise information on their effective results.

Sámi languages

Lule Sámi

52. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts noted that despite the measures taken by the authorities, there was a “need for resolute efforts to be made in many areas such as the shortage of teachers, the lack of knowledge of the language, research, media, literature, development and production of teaching and learning materials in Lule Sámi”. The Committee of Experts “encourage[d] the authorities to increase their efforts to protect and promote Lule Sámi”.

53. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that “efforts to strengthen and promote the Lule Sámi language form an important part of the Action Plan for Sámi Languages”. In 2009 and 2010, the County Governor of Nordland received from the national Government a total of NOK 3.2 million to develop measures to strengthen the Lule Sámi and South Sámi languages. “As a measure in the Action Plan for Sámi Languages, the County Governor of Nordland [...] in 2011 start[ed] improving the competence of pre-school teachers in kindergartens with Lule Sámi children, or which are in areas with a living Lule Sámi culture. [...]”. It has moreover been organizing annual language camps since 2009 for the Lule Sámi pupils, in co-operation with school authorities in Sweden. In 2010, 19 pupils having Lule Sámi as their first language participated. Other measures mentioned by the authorities aim at strengthening career advice for South and Lule Sámi young people; motivating applications to higher education among Sámi students; and limiting the dropout rate from Sámi tuition between primary and lower secondary school and between upper secondary school and higher education.

54. Furthermore, the authorities mention that “the Ministry of Health and Care Services in co-operation with Sámediggi [the Sámi Parliament] will examine more closely how equality in health services can be maintained in the Lule Sámi and South Sámi areas”. The authorities also mention that “[t]he Ministry of Government Administration, Reform and Church Affairs distributes funds for the development of social studies terminology in South Sámi” and that “almost NOK 1.2 million were granted to the Research Council of Norway's Sámi research programme. In 2010, funds were increased to NOK 1.65 million. The funds are earmarked for research efforts into these two languages, including PhD positions”.

55. During the on-the-spot visit, the representatives of the County Governor Nordland mentioned that the 2011 plan has not yet been formally evaluated, but the results are positive. In areas where Lule and South Sámi are represented, they receive particular attention and as a direct result, the languages are much more used and are heard more and more in public places. A general tendency is that many parents who do not speak Sámi want their children to speak the language. The challenge is to create conditions that will reduce the drop out rate due to the lack of motivation of some pupils, who no longer want to continue learning Sámi when difficulties appear. The representatives of the County Governor Nordland also added that they receive from the national Government a total of NOK 2.4 million to develop measures to strengthen the Lule Sámi and South Sámi languages for 2012.

56. The Committee of Experts notes the positive measures that have been taken and recalls that there is still a need for resolute efforts to be made in many areas such as the shortage of teachers, research, media, literature, development and production of teaching materials in Lule Sámi.

South Sámi

57. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts “encourage[d] the authorities to increase their efforts to protect and promote South Sámi, especially in the field of education”. The Committee invited the Norwegian authorities to report on the progress achieved through the Sámi Parliament language and culture project on South Sámi and on the measures envisaged in the White Paper and on the way they were implemented.

58. In their fifth periodical report, the authorities state that efforts to strengthen and promote the South Sámi language “form an important part of the Action Plan”.

59. In order to follow up the Action Plan, the County Governor of Nordland initiated in 2011 a number of measures. One measure is to improve through language courses the competence of pre-school teachers in kindergartens with South Sámi children, or in areas with a living South Sámi culture. The measure will be implemented in co-operation with the County Governor of Nord-Trøndelag and the County Governor of Sør-Trøndelag. Nord-Trøndelag University College will be responsible for the academic content. Other measures mentioned by the authorities aim at strengthening career advice for South and Lule Sámi youth; motivating more applications to higher education among Sámi students; and limiting the dropout rate from Sámi tuition between primary and lower secondary school and between upper secondary school and higher education.

60. Regarding other areas, the authorities mention that “the Ministry of Health and Care Services in co-operation with Sámediggi [the Sámi Parliament] will examine more closely how equality in health services can be maintained in the Lule Sámi and South Sámi areas”. The authorities also mention that “[t]he Ministry of Government Administration, Reform and Church Affairs distributes funds for the development of social studies terminology in South Sámi ” and that “almost NOK 1.2 million was granted to the Research Council of Norway’s Sámi research programme. In 2010, funds were increased to NOK 1.65 million. The funds are earmarked for research efforts into these two languages, including PhD positions”.

61. During the on-the-spot visit, the representatives of the County Governor Nordland mentioned that in the areas where Lule and South Sámi are represented, those languages receive a particular attention and as a direct result, the languages are much more used and are heard more and more in public places. A general tendency is that many parents who do not speak Sámi want their children to speak the language. The difficulty is then to face the high drop out due to the lack of motivation of some pupils, who no longer want to continue learning Sámi as soon as difficulties appear. The representatives of the County Governor Nordland also add that they receive from the national Government a total of NOK 2.4 million to develop measures to strengthen the Lule Sámi and South Sámi languages for 2012.

62. A particular difficulty as far as South Sámi is concerned, is the fact that the relatively few speakers of the language are dispersed over various counties. The language camps and the distance teaching programme give pupils and people in general the possibility to support themselves even though they live far apart.

63. The Committee of Experts notes the positive measures that have been taken but observes that there is still a need for resolute efforts to be made in many areas such as the shortage of teachers, research, media, literature, and the development and production of teaching and learning materials in South Sámi.

Skolt Sámi (Eastern Sámi)

64. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts urged the Norwegian authorities to investigate possibilities in co-operation with Finland to have Skolt Sámi taught.

65. The Norwegian authorities state in the fifth periodical report that the Ministry of Government Administration, Reform and Church Affairs has focused on facilitating the planning of cross-border measures that contribute to revitalising, raising the visibility of and strengthening the East Sámi /Skolt Sámi language. In 2010, a three-year collaboration project was started between East Sámi /Skolt Sámi communities and institutions in Norway, Finland and Russia. The project is funded by grants from *Interreg Sápmi* and national contributions from Norway and Finland. Representatives of the Sámi are associated to this project.

66. The Committee of Experts has also been informed by the Norwegian authorities about the Action Plan for Sámi Languages which foresees measures to revitalise Skolt Sámi. However, the Committee of Experts has no clear information about whether this language is still spoken in Norway. It therefore asks the Norwegian authorities to clarify this issue in the next periodical report.

d. the facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of regional or minority languages, in speech and writing, in public and private life;

Kven

67. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts “encourage[d] the authorities to further enhance their support for Kven culture, through general and/or specific funding mechanisms”. The Committee of Experts also “urge[d] the authorities to take appropriate measures to improve the presence of Kven in broadcasting” as well as in the media in general, through the training of journalists, for instance. Moreover, the Committee of Ministers recommended to “**[c]ontinue their efforts to protect and promote the Kven language in particular [...] in the field of broadcast media**”. Finally, as far as place names are concerned, the Committee of Experts “urge[d] the authorities to report on the practical implementation of th[e] new regulation [on place names]”.

68. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that several Kven cultural projects are and have been supported.

Grants were allocated to three Kven projects in 2011 (involving cultural activities for youth, the publication of Kven Christmas booklets, and work on collating Kven grammar). From 2009 to 2011, support was also given to a 3-year project "Documentation and dissemination of Kven culture" in Troms, operated by The Halti Kven Culture Centre, as well as the funding of a campaign to revitalise the Kven language in Northern Norway. In the same period, funding was provided for the operation of the Language Centre in Storfjord (Norway's first multilingual language centre, which works to strengthen Sámi and Finnish or Kven in the Municipality of Storfjord). The Culture Council of Norway administers and distributes funds from the Norwegian Culture Fund. According to the authorities, the Council supported a number of cultural projects related to the Kven language and culture between 2008 and 2010.

69. During the on-the-spot-visit, the Committee of Experts was informed about the wish of the representatives of the speakers to have earmarked funds. They maintained that because of the weak position of the Kven language and the municipalities' difficult economic situation, without earmarked funds for the protection and promotion of the Kven language, it is difficult to direct money according to the policies decided at national level.

70. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed by the representatives of the speakers that the funding is insufficient and that many important cultural projects cannot be realised due to lack of money. For example, the municipal authorities of Vadsø were forced to abandon their plans for a new building for the *Ruija Kvenmuseum*, due to the absence of funding from the national authorities.

71. As far as place names are concerned, the authorities fund the project "Kven names on the internet and map" organised by the Varanger Museum IKS. As to the practical implementation of the Place Name Act with regard to Kven, the authorities mention that responsibility for adopting signs on classified and county roads has been delegated to the district offices of the Norwegian Public Roads Administration, while municipalities are responsible for adopting signs on municipal roads (signs authority). In order for a Kven place name to be used on a sign, the place name must be approved and registered in the Central Place Name Registry. The Signs Standard states that such established place names shall be used on any road direction sign where the place name appears.

72. During the monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts was informed by representatives of the Kven speakers that work to collect Kven place names needs to be continued and that particular consideration should be given to the fact that the elderly part of the population that still uses the Kven names are slowly diminishing. According to the representatives of the Kven speakers, the funding is insufficient for collecting and systematizing place names with a view to using them on maps, signs, etc.

73. As far as place names are concerned, the Committee of Experts urges the authorities to report on the practical implementation of the Act on Place Names and encourages them to take measures to facilitate the effective collecting of Kven place names.

74. As to the presence of Kven in the written media, the authorities mention the existence of the Kven newspaper *Ruijan Kaiku*. From 2011 Ruijan Kaiku's grant has been moved from the Norwegian Culture Fund to a fixed operational subsidy directly from the Ministry of Culture in order to provide the newspaper with more predictable budget support. Ruijan Kaiku's grant amounted to NOK 1 million in 2011 and 1 million 31 thousand in 2012. There are 10 to 12 issues per year with around 530 subscribers in 2012. The Committee of Experts encourages the Norwegian authorities to increase the support of the Kven *Ruijan Kaiku* newspaper in order for it to be published more frequently and to encourage and facilitate the training of Kven speaking journalists.

75. As to the broadcasting media, the Norwegian authorities recognise the insufficient presence of the Kven language in broadcasting and the Minister of Culture, via Norwegian Broadcasting Corporation's (NRK's) general assembly, "demanded that this must be pursued".

76. During the on-the-spot visit, the representatives of the speakers mentioned that a 12-minute radio programme is broadcast weekly by the NRK, but that this programme is mainly in Finnish, and that there is a Nordic academic journal called Arina, that is issued once a year. The representatives of the Kven speakers however find the media offer in their language to be insufficient. They would like the *Ruijan Kaiku* to become a weekly publication and the radio broadcasting to increase. They consider that satisfactory media provision in the Kven language to be one of the most effective measures to curb the decrease in the number of language users in all age groups. The representatives of the Kven speakers also mentioned that Kvens are not included in the programme of the NRK for educating journalists for other minorities.

77. The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities to further enhance their support for Kven culture, through general and/or specific funding mechanisms and to make sure, through the establishment of a structured dialogue with the speakers, that they are supporting the measures which the speakers consider important.

The Committee of Experts strongly urges the authorities to take appropriate measures to improve the presence of Kven in broadcasting.

Romani/Romanes

78. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts "encourage[d] the authorities to take measures to improve the presence of Romani and Romanes in public life".

79. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state the permanent exhibition at Glomdalsmuseet, Latjo Drom, that presents the Romani people's/Taters' culture and language. They also mention that the Romani People's/Taters' Culture Fund works at increasing the presence of Romani in public life. Furthermore, they mention that the Ministry of Government Administration, Reform and Church Affairs has provided annual support to the International Gypsy Music Festival Yagori since 2000. In 2010, this support amounted to NOK 321 000. The festival presents some of the foremost practitioners of international gypsy music and dance.

80. The Committee of Experts welcomes the measures taken and underlines the necessity of such measures to fight against discrimination and negative stereotypes. It however notes that no measures are taken to specifically promote the use of the language in the media.

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities to take measures to improve the presence of Romani and Romanes in public life, in particular in the media.

Sámi languages

81. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed that there are still, among the majority population, some negative attitudes towards Sámi people, culture and languages. The “heated debate” that took place prior to local elections in Tromsø regarding the possible inclusion of Tromsø in the Sámi administrative area, was an example of this. Representatives of the Sámi Parliament mentioned the fact that, as a consequence, some people no longer declare that they are Sámi and do not use the Sámi languages in public life. It has also been underlined that some Sámi speakers are reluctant to ask for Sámi interpretation in relations with the administration, as this would imply that they do not speak Norwegian, which they consider difficult and stigmatizing.

82. Representatives of the Sámi Parliament also mentioned that a recent PhD study on discrimination showed that health care services offered to Sámi outside the Sámi administrative area are not generally conducted in Sámi, even if there is a duty to provide information in these languages. The study also shows that Sámi-speaking women seek less help for their health problems than Norwegian-speaking women.

83. Representatives of the Sámi Parliament also mentioned a report underlining that the Norwegian Correctional Services have to prioritize measures to fulfil Sámi-speaking prisoners' language rights.

84. The Committee of Experts looks forward to precise information on the situation of the Sámi-speaking prisoners and the measures taken to ensure their rights in the next periodical report.

Lule Sámi

85. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts noted that “the authorities should investigate the possibilities of stimulating the use of Lule Sámi, especially outside the institutions”. For example, the presence of Lule Sámi in the media was considered insufficient. Moreover, as far as the use of Lule Sámi in judicial proceedings was concerned, the Committee of Experts invited the authorities to report on the outcome of the project carried out by the Ministry of Justice and the municipality of Tana on the development of Sámi legal terminology in criminal law and civil procedure law. With respect to the use of Lule Sámi with the administrative authorities, the Committee of Experts invited the relevant authorities to come back to this issue in the fifth periodical report. The Committee of Experts encouraged the authorities to provide information on the use of Lule Sámi on public signs and buildings.

86. In the fifth periodical report the authorities state that the use of Lule Sámi outside the institutions is an important focal point of the Action Plan for Sámi Languages. One project carried out by the University of Nordland, as part of this Action Plan, is to strengthen Sámi languages (amongst them Lule Sámi) through social media. Another project, that started in autumn 2010, is the transmission of features, humour, fiction and news videos on YouTube (*Nuoraj TV*). The project is partly funded by the Ministry of Government Administration, Reform and Church Affairs. Young people, the target group of the project, can participate by submitting videos. The authorities also mention that NRK must “contribute to strengthen the Norwegian and Sámi languages, identity and culture” and that “NRK must have daily broadcasts for the Sámi population” (NRK governing document). The majority of NRK Sápmi’s broadcasts on radio and television are in North Sámi, but Lule Sámi also has regular radio broadcasts. The authorities add that a news programme *Ođđasat* is broadcast from Monday to Thursday on the P2 national network and uses both Sámi and Norwegian, which also includes South Sámi and Lule Sámi. As far as the written media are concerned, the NordSalten newspaper, which is a local newspaper in the Lule Sámi language area, receives funds via the Ministry of Culture’s budget to produce articles in Lule Sámi. According to the authorities, NordSalten produced 70 pages in Lule Sámi in 2010.

87. With respect to the use of Lule Sámi with the administrative authorities, the authorities inform that in a survey carried out in 2008, 80% of the institutions in the Lule Sámi area that answered declared that the population receives services in Lule Sámi. 20% of them answered that they do not provide services to the public in Lule Sámi. The authorities add that pursuant to the Sámi Act, announcements from public bodies directed at the population within the administrative district must be made in both Sámi and Norwegian. In practice, this could be in the form of newspaper advertisements. However, national authorities have little control of how this is implemented in practice.

88. Concerning the use of place names, the authorities mention in the fifth report that the Act on Place Names requires that Lule Sámi names are used in public spaces alongside the Norwegian name in the Municipality of Tysfjord. In general, a growing number of public buildings are being given bilingual signs with Sámi and Norwegian names. In the administrative district for Sámi language, awareness has been raised around Sámi signs, although there is no direct requirement for this in the regulations (however Report no. 28 (2007-2008) to the Storting – Sámi Policy and the Action Plan for Sámi Languages emphasise the importance of raising the visibility of the Sámi languages in public).

89. Representatives of the public broadcasting NRK mentioned that 30 minutes (two 15-minute slots) are broadcast every week in Lule Sámi on the radio (on the national network) and that Lule Sámi primarily appears on television in the *Odđasat* news programme when a Lule Sámi reporter shares news on what is taking place in his/her area. According to the Norwegian authorities, a 2011 survey counted 17 news features produced in Lule Sámi that year. As regards the written press, the weekly newspaper NordSalten has an appendix written in Lule Sámi.

90. The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities to continue their efforts for the Lule Sámi language to be more present in public life.

South Sámi

91. As far as the use of Sámi in judicial proceedings is concerned, the Committee of Experts invites the authorities to report on the outcome of the project carried out by the Ministry of Justice and the municipality of Tana on the development of Sámi legal terminology in criminal law and civil procedure law. With respect to the use of South Sámi for place names and signs, the Committee of Experts “encourage[d] the authorities to provide information in this respect in their [fifth] report”. The Committee of Experts also asked for complementary explanations as to whether the Office for Labour and Welfare that was set up in Snåsa would still deal with health issues. Concerning media, the Committee of Experts encouraged the authorities to provide information on the periodical church magazine issued 4 times a year.

92. Regarding measures taken for the development of Sámi legal terminology, the authorities state in their fifth report projects run by the Municipality of Tana. The Committee of Experts understands that those projects are only working on North Sámi legal terminology. According to the information given by the authorities during the on-the-spot-visit, the projects will be completed this year. The Committee of Experts was informed that no such projects exist for Lule and South Sámi.

93. As far as place names are concerned, the authorities state in their fifth report that Snåsa Municipal Council decided in a meeting on 27 May 2010 that the Sámi name “Snåasen tjielte” should be the co-official name of the municipality in addition to Norwegian. The Municipal Council's decision was ratified in a cabinet meeting on 24 September 2010.

94. On welfare, the authorities state in their report that the Norwegian Labour and Welfare Administration (NAV) does not deal with health matters as such. Sámi speakers are however taken care of with respect to both languages and culture and NAV has stated that job advertisements for vacant positions at NAV's office in Snåsa will request South Sámi language skills.

95. As to the use of South Sámi in the media, the authorities state in their report that NRK must “contribute to strengthen the Norwegian and Sámi languages, identity and culture” and that “NRK must have daily broadcasts for the Sámi population” (NRK governing document). The majority of NRK Sápmis’ broadcasts on radio and television are in North Sámi, but South Sámi also has regular broadcasts. The authorities add that a news programme *Ođđasat* is broadcast from Monday to Thursday on the P2 national radio network and that both Sámi and Norwegian are used, including South Sámi and Lule Sámi. As to the printed press, the local weekly newspaper “*Snåsningen*”, has an appendix written in South Sámi with financial support from the Ministry of Culture (making about 38 pages in total).

96. Representatives of the public broadcasting NRK mentioned that 30 minutes (two 15-minute slots) are broadcast every week on the radio (on the national network) and that South Sámi primarily appears on television when a South Sámi reporter shares news on what is taking place in his/her area, as the news is usually presented in North Sámi.

97. The Committee of Experts considers that, in view of the dispersal of South Sámi speakers, the presence of the language in electronic media and its visibility in the public space is especially important. It therefore encourages the authorities to continue their efforts for the South Sámi language to be more present in electronic media and in public life.

e. the maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups using a regional or minority language and other groups in the State employing a language used in identical or similar form, as well as the establishment of cultural relations with other groups in the State using different languages;

98. In the fourth monitoring round, the Committee of Experts was not informed of any establishment of a forum for all regional and minority languages in Norway. It “encourage[d] the authorities to take new initiatives with a view to creating such a forum”.

99. In the fifth periodical report, the authorities state that no new initiatives have been taken by the Government to establish such a forum.

100. The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities to take new initiatives with a view to creating links or opportunities for exchange of views among representatives of all regional and minority languages.

f. the provision of appropriate forms and means for the teaching and study of regional or minority languages at all appropriate stages;

Kven

101. The Committee of Experts refers to the description of the situation in its previous report. Noting that the place of Kven in education is marginal, the Committee of Experts “invite[d] the Norwegian authorities to provide exact figures on the number of children attending Kven education at different levels” and “urge[d] the authorities to develop a special curriculum for Kven in co-operation with the speakers and to improve the situation of the Kven language at all appropriate stages of education”. Moreover, the Committee of Ministers recommended to “[c]ontinue their efforts to protect and promote the Kven language in particular in education [...]”.

102. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state the measures that are taken to promote primary and secondary education in Kven and in Finnish:

- “Pupils with Kven-Finnish backgrounds in primary and lower secondary schools in Troms and Finnmark are entitled to learn Finnish as a second language when at least three pupils request this. Tuition can be provided in Kven”.
- “Statistics for primary and lower secondary school education in/about the languages of national minorities are provided by The School Information System (Grunnskolen informasjonssystem (GSI). In the 2010/2011 school year, 754 pupils in primary and lower secondary schools were given lessons in Finnish as a second language. It is not recorded whether the lessons are in Finnish as a second language or Kven. Lessons in Kven may be given if the children/parents request this. At the upper secondary level there are 24 pupils in Finnmark and two pupils in Troms who receive lessons in Finnish”.

- "As a part of the Knowledge Promotion Reform, a new curriculum has been developed for Finnish as a second language, which includes lessons from the first year of primary school up to and including the third year of upper secondary school. This curriculum includes both the Kven and Finnish languages, as well as Kven and Finnish culture. When developing the current curriculum it was important to emphasise that the students have language tuition options (in Finnish or Kven), contrary to the previous curriculum".
- Grants are provided for training and for study authorisation for teachers as well as to county authority employees. Grants are also provided for private schools who provide tuition in Finnish as a second language to pupils and apprentices with Kven-Finnish backgrounds in upper secondary education. Furthermore, a co-operation has been established between several schools in the counties of Finnmark and Troms and the county of Lapland in Finland on training in Finnish. The county governors of Troms and Finnmark organise an annual seminar for teachers who teach Finnish as a second language curriculum (parts of the programme will always deal with the Kven dimension).
- As far as teaching materials are concerned, grants are also provided for the development of teaching materials in Kven-Finnish. Various books have been produced from 2005-2008 and from 2009, the County Governor of Finnmark has expanded its work to develop teaching materials in Finnish and Kven as a second language. The Norwegian authorities also mention that the County Governor has been informed that standardised written Kven will soon be ready for use, meaning that textbooks can be translated into Kven. This work will be done in co-operation with the Kven speakers. The County Governor has in 2011 provided funding to produce a textbook for primary schools in Kven, to develop the website kvensk.no and the digital textbook Aikamatka for students in upper secondary school.

103. As to the use of Kven in higher education, according to the periodical report, no measures have been implemented by the Ministry of Education and Research to develop a special syllabus for Kven language users. Finnmark University College is now working with the University of Tromsø to find a division of work with a view to developing language courses in Kven.

104. Early in 2012, the Committee of Experts was informed that the primary school in Porsanger municipality, the only Kven school in Norway, would be closed down in autumn 2012. No information has been given on the future possibility of Kven education for the pupils who attend those classes. According to the representatives of the Kven speakers, the closing of this school will moreover have a negative impact on other Kven language-related measures linked to the community surrounding the school, like the Børselv Childhood Centre, that also will be closed down.

105. The reason for closing the Kven school has not been made clear to the Committee of Experts. During the on-the-spot-visit the Committee of Experts was informed by the Ministry of Education that the decision had been taken by the municipality and was now under consideration by the County Governor of Finnmark, who can rule on formalities relevant to the municipality's decision. The Ministry, however, would/could do nothing. The Committee of Experts asks the authorities to make sure that the eventual closing of this school does not hamper the application of the Charter in Norway. The Committee of Experts tried to contact the representatives of the Porsanger municipal authorities on the issue of the closing of the school, to no avail. The Ministry informed the Committee of Experts that it has no power to change the decision of the Porsanger municipal assembly. Based on the information received, the Committee of Experts is of the view that the closure of the only school where Kven is taught is a grave blow to the promotion of the Kven language, which is already in a precarious situation. It therefore urges the relevant Ministry to take immediate contact with the Porsanger municipality with the purpose of ensuring that Kven education will be available for the pupils who want it in the forthcoming school year.

106. The Committee of Experts did not receive any information as to the elaboration of a separate and special curriculum for Kven.

107. According to representatives of the Finnmark and Troms Counties an Internet website containing teaching tips and material is funded by central government and administered by the Counties. Moreover two text books will be ready in summer 2012 for the 3rd and 4th grades. Representatives of the Kven speakers however still point to the lack of teaching materials. According to them, there is also a lack of qualified teachers at all levels. They mentioned that there is no study programme in the Kven language for teachers even though it is an established subject in Norwegian schools. Some of them suggested that a collaboration between the teacher education institutions of Norway and Finland could be set up. It would also be necessary, according to the representatives of the Kven speakers, that continuing education for teachers be remunerated and that the teachers who are elaborating textbooks receive financial and administrative support.

108. The representatives of the Kven speakers also underlined the need for kindergartens and language nests, which they believe are essential for the survival of the Kven language, as well as a literacy programme for adults, as for many of the language users the Kven language is a passive language.

109. The Committee of Experts invites the Norwegian authorities to provide exact figures on the number of children attending Kven education at different levels and looks forward to receiving information on the development of school materials in the Kven language.

The Committee of Experts strongly urges the authorities to develop a special curriculum for Kven in co-operation with the speakers and to improve the situation of the Kven language at all appropriate stages of education.

Romani/Romanes

110. In its previous evaluation report, the Committee of Experts “encourage[d] the authorities to pursue their efforts in co-operation with the speakers to develop alternative ways and appropriate forms of teaching Romani and Romanes and in particular to produce adequate teaching materials and to provide teacher training” and it “urge[d] the authorities to take measures to develop teaching materials and to provide teacher training in Romani and Romanes”. Moreover, the Committee of Ministers recommended to “**[t]ake measures to develop language education in Romani and Romanes in co-operation with the speakers**”.

111. As regards the Romani language, in their fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state the economic support to the Taters’ Association of Norway (*Taternes Landsforening*) that took place in 2007 and 2009 and that was aiming at creating a textbook for Romani (as first language) tuition. It is, however, not clear to the Committee of Experts whether this project is still supported. The Committee of Experts has been informed that a project for collecting words and developing a Romani dictionary has received funds, as well as a project aiming at encouraging young members to learn the Romani language.

With regard to Romanes, the Norwegian authorities add that in co-operation with a Roma association (*Romani Kultura*), a scheme has been established for primary and lower secondary schools who wish to use Romanes-speaking first language assistants. In January 2011, a course for bilingual kindergarten assistants was started at Oslo University College in which assistants with Roma backgrounds will participate. Norway has also initiated co-operation with Sweden on online resources for first language tuition (several varieties of Romanes) (<http://modersmal.skolverket.se/romani/>). As of 2011, the website www.morsmal.no is administered by the National Centre for Multicultural Education. A report has also been made by the Ministry of Education and Research on the relationship between the Education Act and international conventions, particularly with Roma in mind.

112. During the on-the-spot visit, the representatives of the Taters mentioned a project aiming at collecting stories from old travellers and transcribing them. The transcribed text will then be used to develop a written standard. This project involves the *Taternes Landsforening* and a Professor in linguistics from the University of Oslo. The Committee of Experts is looking forward to receiving information on the progress of this project in the next periodical report.

113. The Committee of Experts welcomes the measures taken and encourages the authorities to continue its support to projects aimed at protecting and promoting Romani and Romanes.

Sámi languages

114. During the on-the-spot visit, the representatives of the Sámi Parliament underlined the unsatisfactory way distance teaching is organised as it requires pupils to work alone with no direct and personal support. Moreover, the way the teaching is organised means that pupils have to choose between going to Sámi classes or attending some compulsory subject classes. Another difficulty in Sámi education is the high drop out rate between primary and secondary education.

115. The authorities also reported that closer transnational co-operation with Sweden in regard to all three Sámi languages (with special emphasis on co-operation on Lule and South Sámi) is being developed, including the elaboration of a proposal for a collaboration agreement between Sweden and Norway on Sámi tuition. The co-operation is intended to cover first and foremost distance education, teacher training and teaching materials. The agreement was supposed to be presented to the Ministries of Education and Research in Sweden and Norway in September 2011, but the Committee of Experts has not been informed whether the agreement has indeed been presented. It encourages the authorities to provide information about the agreement and how it is followed up in the next periodical report.

Lule Sámi

116. In the fourth monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts “encourage[d] the authorities to provide an assessment of the situation of pre-school education in Lule Sámi” and “invite[d] the authorities to clarify the situation [on whether Lule Sámi courses are offered at the Sámi University College] and indicate the number of students”. The Committee of Experts “urge[d] the authorities to strengthen their efforts in improving education in Lule Sámi, in particular concerning the training of teachers and the production of teaching materials”. Moreover, the Committee of Ministers recommended to “**[c]ontinue their efforts to provide teaching in/of Lule [...] Sámi, including the development of teaching materials and teacher training**”.

117. In the fifth periodical report the authorities state that in regard to pre-school education in the municipalities of Bodø and Tysfjord, a total of 27 children with Lule Sámi background had their kindergarten provision tailored on the basis of their language background in 2010. The County Governor of Nordland has received funds from the Ministry of Education and Research to strengthen work with the Lule Sámi and South Sámi languages. Several seminars and network meetings have been arranged between kindergartens and schools in this respect.

118. With regard to primary and lower secondary education, the authorities mention that in the 2010/2011 school year, 29 students chose Lule Sámi as a first language and 68 had Lule Sámi as a second language. The number of students in traditional Lule Sámi areas is stable, but there is increasing demand in the cities. There is a need to facilitate tuition in Lule Sámi, especially in distance education.

119. With regard to upper secondary education, the authorities report that in the 2010/2011 school year, 23 students chose Lule Sámi as a first language and 11 as a second language.

120. As far as higher education is concerned, the authorities state that the County Governor of Nordland arranged a motivation and recruitment seminar for Lule Sámi youth. The purpose of the seminar was to motivate Lule Sámi youth to pursue higher education.

121. As far as distance education is concerned, the authorities state that the County Governor of Nordland has organised courses on distance education and is developing a scheme to improve teachers' competence. In addition, the Ministry of Education and Research is establishing Drag School as a resource centre for Lule Sámi distance education. The target groups are primary and lower secondary school pupils all over the country who are entitled to education in Lule Sámi. The resource centre is currently working to capacity and requires more teachers. According to the authorities, the transition from pilot projects to ordinary operations presents some challenges, particularly in connection with teaching resources and operation in 2012. The Directorate for Education and Training will, in co-operation with the county governors of Nordland and Finnmark, continue its work on the plan for Sámi distance education to ensure that the service maintains a high level of quality and also satisfies the demand.

122. On teacher training, the authorities state that “[t]he County Governor of Nordland has focused on improving language training for South and Lule Sámi teachers. The County Governor has invited highly qualified teachers from Scotland and Israel to teach Lule Sámi teachers efficient language training techniques. An educational programme for South and Lule Sámi, based on the so-called Ulpan method is under development”. The authorities also mention that the County Governor organises annual teacher conferences on Lule Sámi tuition.

123. As to the teaching materials, the Norwegian authorities refer to a working group that was established in 2009 with representatives from the Sámi Parliament, the Ministry of Education and Research and the Norwegian Directorate for Education and Training. In June 2010, the group presented a report with proposals for measures for more efficient development and production of Sámi teaching materials, including separate measures for South Sámi and Lule Sámi teaching aids. The County Governor of Nordland has also granted funds for the completion of *Samasta*, which is a computer based course in Lule Sámi.

124. During the on-the-spot visit the representatives of the University of Tromsø mentioned that a lot of teaching material is now available on the Internet and open to everybody. According to them, especially local teachers could/should use it. They also informed the Committee of Experts that co-operation between the different language centres began in January 2012. In March 2012, the Lule Sámi Centre published a dictionary on the Internet. In the view of the University representatives, the Sámi languages still lack visibility and prestige. According to them, there is a continuous need to build a positive attitude towards the Sámi languages in order to remove prejudices against the languages.

125. The Committee of Experts welcomes the actions taken by the authorities.

South Sámi

126. In the fourth monitoring round, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the authorities **“[c]ontinue their efforts to provide teaching in/of [...] South Sámi, including the development of teaching materials and teacher training”**. The Committee of Experts noted in its fourth evaluation report the measures taken in pre-school and primary school teaching and welcomed the initiative of the Ministry of Education and Research and the Sámi Parliament, who were ready to discuss the need for more permanent actions directed towards pre-schools in the South Sámi district in connection with the implementation of a new competence plan for the sector. The Committee of Experts looked forward to receiving more information on this possibility of action. The Committee of Expert also noted the educational options offered in South Sámi. It however mentioned that “despite the need to update the offer at primary and secondary level following the 2008 Knowledge Promotion programme, there [were] many deficiencies due to the lack of teaching materials and of a complete curriculum in South Sámi”. The Committee of Experts “urge[d] the authorities to strengthen their efforts in improving education in South Sámi, in particular concerning the training of teachers and the production of teaching materials”.

127. In the fifth periodical report the authorities state that as far as pre-school education is concerned, the Ministry of Education and Research and the Sámi Parliament co-operate to disseminate information via brochures, meetings, etc. for individuals and municipal authorities about the possibility of having pre-school education in South Sámi. The County Governors of Troms, Nordland, Sør-Trøndelag and Nord-Trøndelag have been specially tasked with co-operating with the Sámi Parliament on measures aimed at the South Sámi kindergarten sector. The County Governor of Nordland has been organising courses for kindergarten staff since 2009. The authorities also mention that in 2011, 10 children attended South Sámi kindergarten (in the municipality of Snåsa) and another 10 received language training in South Sámi.

128. Regarding other measures taken in the education sector, the authorities state that the Ministry of Education and Research has its own competence strategy that focuses on language as a particular priority area. The county governors have, in co-operation with the Sámi Parliament, initiated various language development measures. The Norwegian authorities also mention that according to the School Information System (GSI), in the school year 2010/2011, 18 pupils in primary and lower secondary education chose South Sámi as a first language and 72 pupils received tuition in South Sámi as a second language. In upper secondary education, 4 pupils chose South Sámi as a first language and 10 chose it as a second language. In the special distance education sphere, the County Governor of Nordland has organised courses on distance education and is developing a scheme to improve teachers' competence in this education method.

129. Moreover, annual conferences are arranged by the County Governor of Nordland to bolster the competence and motivation of South Sámi teachers. Co-operation with Sweden already exists concerning language camps for South Sámi pupils (organised by the County Governor of Nordland). Those camps are presented to have a good impact on the use of the South Sámi in everyday life. “So far four language camps have been held, and interest in these camps has been significant”.

130. On teacher training, the County Governor of Nordland reports about a project to improve language training for South and Lule Sámi teachers. The County Governor has invited highly qualified teachers from Scotland and Israel to teach South Sámi teachers efficient language training techniques. An educational programme for South and Lule Sámi, based on the so-called Ulpan method is under development.

131. As to the teaching materials, the Norwegian authorities state that in 2009, a working group was established with representatives from the Sámi Parliament, the Ministry of Education and Research and the Norwegian Directorate for Education and Training to develop teaching material in South Sámi. In June 2010, the group presented a report with proposals for measures for more efficient development and production of Sámi teaching materials, including separate measures for South Sámi and Lule Sámi teaching aids. The County Governor of Nordland also operates a network for South Sámi teachers, which focuses on the needs of these teachers and the challenges they face. The County Governor has also developed a database for educational material in South Sámi.

132. The Committee of Experts welcomes the actions taken by the authorities. It looks forward to receiving information on the results of the concrete actions taken by the Ministry of Education towards teaching in/of South Sámi and on the measures that have been taken by the County Governors of Troms, Nordland, Sør-Trøndelag and Nord-Trøndelag in co-operation with the Sámi Parliament.

Skolt Sámi

133. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts "invite[d] the Norwegian authorities to find ways to meet the demand for learning Skolt Sámi, for example through co-operation with Finland".

134. In the fifth periodical report the authorities state the actions that have been taken, in co-operation with Finland and Russia, for the strengthening and developing of the identity, language and culture in a transnational perspective.

135. The Committee of Experts looks forward for more information on the substance of the co-operation in the next periodical report.

g. the provision of facilities enabling non-speakers of a regional or minority language living in the area where it is used to learn it if they so desire;

136. In the last evaluation report, the Committee of Experts welcomed the initiatives aiming at teaching North, South and Lule Sámi as well as Kven to non-speakers.

137. In the fifth periodical report, no particular information is given on this point. The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities to provide information on the results of the initiatives taken in the next periodical report.

h. the promotion of study and research on regional or minority languages at universities or equivalent institutions;

Kven

138. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts "encourage[d] the authorities to take measures to promote a permanent offer of Kven language courses at the University of Tromsø".

139. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that no special measures have been implemented by the Ministry of Education and Research to promote a permanent offer of Kven language courses at the University of Tromsø. The Ministry states that such issues are decided upon by the University board.

140. According to the representatives of the Kven speakers, the University of Tromsø and Finnmark University College provide courses in Kven. These courses are however not permanent, are offered at irregular intervals and only at undergraduate level. There are moreover no ear-marked funds and positions for the Kven language, literature or culture at the University of Tromsø, nor at the Finnmark University College. The Research Council of Norway's programme for research in Kven/Finnish/Forest Finnish issues was also terminated in 2008 and has not been continued.

The Committee of Experts encourages the Norwegian authorities to take measures to promote a permanent offer of Kven language courses.

Romani/ Romanes

141. In the fourth monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts was informed that several projects, supported by the Norwegian authorities, were carried out in co-operation with the speakers. However, the Committee of Experts noted that despite these initiatives, there is still a clear lack of qualified persons to carry out research on the Romani language. The Committee of Experts had not received any new information regarding research and study related to Romani and Romanes languages at university or higher education institutions during the last monitoring cycle. It therefore encouraged the authorities to provide such information in the fifth periodical report.

142. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that the Research Council of Norway has for several years worked on initiating research into Romani and Romanes. This has been very difficult for various reasons, but the Research Council of Norway announced a PhD project position on the Romani language in 2012.

143. During the on-the-spot visit representatives of the Romani speakers underlined the need for research on Roma and the Romani/Romanes languages. They expressed their wish to have a specialist on Roma/Tater issues in Norway.

144. The Committee of Experts welcomes the new developments in this sphere and looks forward to receiving information on the PhD project in the next periodical report.

Sámi languages

Lule Sámi

145. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts noted the work done by the Árran centre on Sámi language issues, as a member of the University of the Arctic which co-ordinates the work of the Sámi Institutions Network on High North Affairs and by the Bodø University College (Nordland County). It however mentioned that there is a lack of research in/on Lule Sámi in general.

146. The Committee of Experts has not received any new information on the matter.

South Sámi

147. During the fourth monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts was informed that the Hedmark University College in Hamar offered courses for bilingual language teachers, and that the courses were attended by South Sámi teachers from both Norway and Sweden. The Committee of Experts "encourage[d] the Norwegian authorities to provide more information about this offer, including statistics on the number and profile of teachers trained".

148. In the fifth periodical report, the authorities state that there is one three-year undergraduate programme in the teaching of specific school subjects for bilingual teachers at Hedmark University College. A bachelor's degree allows students to specialise further in various languages including South Sámi as an optional course.

149. The Committee of Experts looks forward to receiving information on the number of students who attend these South Sámi classes.

i. the promotion of appropriate types of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for regional or minority languages used in identical or similar form in two or more States.

150. According to the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities organise study tours to Sweden for the Minister and State Secretary with responsibility for national minorities. This co-operation is useful because, on the whole, the same groups are recognised as national minorities in these two countries. The authorities also add in the report that some of the national minority organisations have contacts with similar organisations in Sweden and have been able to use part of the Government's support for the organisations for this purpose. The cross-border language camps that are organised in co-operation with Swedish educational authorities are also mentioned.

Kven

151. According to the representatives of the Kven speakers, the authorities have made a Plan of Action for Cultural Collaboration in the Northern Areas, which set up many opportunities for collaboration with Sweden, Finland and Russia. Although Kven sister languages can be found in these countries, collaboration using Kven is not mentioned in the report.

Sámi languages

152. As mentioned above, closer transnational co-operation with Sweden on the main three Sámi languages (with special emphasis on co-operation on Lule and South Sámi) was studied, with the elaboration of a proposal for a collaboration agreement between Sweden and Norway on Sámi tuition, first and foremost with distance education, teacher training and teaching materials. The agreement was supposed to be presented to the Ministries of Education and Research in Sweden and Norway in September 2011, but the Committee of Experts has not been informed whether the agreement has indeed been presented. It encourages the authorities to provide information about the agreement and how it is followed up in the next periodical report.

153. There is also a general programme on Skolt Sámi culture with Russia and Sweden which, according to information received, benefits from financial support from the European Union.

Paragraph 2

The Parties undertake to eliminate, if they have not yet done so, any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of a regional or minority language and intended to discourage or endanger the maintenance or development of it. The adoption of special measures in favour of regional or minority languages aimed at promoting equality between the users of these languages and the rest of the population or which take due account of their specific conditions is not considered to be an act of discrimination against the users of more widely-used languages.

154. No mention on this field is made by the authorities in the fifth periodical report.

155. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed by representatives of various minority languages speakers, that there are some cases where the schools encourage parents not to demand any instruction in Kven or Sámi, for instance by telling them that the child then misses out on instruction in Norwegian or other basic subjects.

156. The Committee of Experts urges the Norwegian authorities to take the necessary measures for such discouragement to no longer take place.

Paragraph 3

The Parties undertake to promote, by appropriate measures, mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country and in particular the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to regional or minority languages among the objectives of education and training provided within their countries and encouragement of the mass media to pursue the same objective.

157. According to the representatives of minority language speakers, the Norwegian society still has very little knowledge about the Kven, Sámi and Roma languages and the cultures that are related to them. In the fifth periodical report, the authorities state that the Norwegian Directorate for Education and Training is creating a brochure to provide an overview of and an insight into the five national minorities in Norway. During the on-the-spot visit, the Norwegian authorities mentioned that a school book on national minorities is being produced. The Committee of Experts welcomes these initiatives and encourages the authorities to provide information on the production and distribution of these documents in the next periodical report.

158. The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities to ensure that teachers have enough material and knowledge about the minority languages and the cultures they represent to positively include them in their teaching. It also encourages the authorities to support projects from the minorities that aim at sharing information on their languages and cultures, such as for example the project for a new Sámi house of culture in Oslo, as a replacement of the former one.

Paragraph 4

In determining their policy with regard to regional or minority languages, the Parties shall take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the groups which use such languages. They are encouraged to establish bodies, if necessary, for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to regional or minority languages.

159. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts encouraged the authorities to comment on the fact that, during the fourth monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts had received complaints from representatives of the Kven speakers on insufficient co-operation with the authorities in matters relating to the promotion and protection of the Kven language.

160. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that they consulted minority language speakers when drafting their report and that they received oral and written contributions, which they partly included in the report. With regard to education, the authorities add that the County Governor of Finnmark maintains a dialogue and has held meetings with the special interest organisations Norsk-Finsk Forbund (Norwegian-Finnish Association) and the Norwegian Kven Organisation. The challenges associated with language learning have been discussed. The two special interest organisations regularly provide information about what is happening within their organisations. The Kven Language Council has also participated in a seminar for teachers of Finnish as a second language in order to inform them on the development of written Kven. The seminar was organised by the County Governor.

161. During the on-the-spot visit the authorities mentioned that the Kven are asked to participate each time before some measures affecting them are to be taken by the authorities. In view of the authorities, the reason why the representatives of the Kven speakers feel left aside is probably because they would like more actions to be taken for their language. The representatives of the Kven however underline the long delays in receiving answers to questions put to the authorities.

162. Representatives of the Sámi Parliament also mentioned that there is no competent body where a complaint on the application of the Sámi Act or on the quality of the teaching in Sámi languages can be made. A specific body for language issues, such as an Ombudsman, could be created.

163. The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities to continue the dialogue with the minority language representatives, in matters related to their languages.

Paragraph 5

The Parties undertake to apply, mutatis mutandis, the principles listed in paragraphs 1 to 4 above to non-territorial languages. However, as far as these languages are concerned, the nature and scope of the measures to be taken to give effect to this Charter shall be determined in a flexible manner, bearing in mind the needs and wishes, and respecting the traditions and characteristics, of the groups which use the languages concerned.

164. In the case of Norway, Romanes and Romani are considered non-territorial languages. In evaluating their situation under Article 7, paragraphs 1 to 4, the Committee of Experts kept in mind that those principles should be applied *mutatis mutandis*.

3.2. Evaluation in respect of Part III of the Charter

165. Regarding North Sámi, most of the undertakings were fulfilled in the Sámi Administrative District during the previous monitoring rounds.

166. The evaluation report from 2010 makes the same conclusion as the one from 2007 and underlines that there has been a positive development with regard to the strengthening of Sámi language and culture since the entry into force of the Sámi Language Act in 1992. Earmarked funds for bilingualism seem to have been necessary, especially in view of the weak position of the Sámi language and the municipalities' difficult economic situation.

167. During the last monitoring round, the Committee of Experts invited the authorities to provide information on the expansions of the Ája Sámi Centre in Kåfjord.

168. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that the Centre for Northern Peoples (formerly the Ája Sámi Centre) plays an important role in the preservation and development of Sámi culture. The extension of the centre, with premises for a museum and Sámi library, has been completed and was opened to the public in 2011. The project received a total of NOK 22 million in the period 2007-2011. The project framework includes expenses for exhibits and equipment.

169. During the present monitoring cycle, the Sámi administrative area was expanded, as Lavangen municipality became part of the Sámi administrative area in 2009. The municipality had applied to the Government to be included and had already introduced Sámi education in primary school. Around 20 % of the population in Lavangen has a Sámi background, but many of them have lost their language. There are around 1000 inhabitants in Lavangen.

170. In 2010, Lavangen adopted a Sámi language plan. The aim of the plan is to strengthen Sámi language, culture and identity, and it will work in the period 2011-2015. It is stated that Sámi shall also in the future be a living language to be used in all circumstances, and that Sámi and Norwegian shall be equal in local administration and public services. The three central rights in the Sámi Act form the basis for the language plan: everybody has the right to use Sámi in contact with public bodies, to encounter Sámi in public settings and to receive teaching in and of Sámi.

The municipality has decided:

- that all employees will be trained in Sámi
- to promote the skills in Sámi amongst the whole population
- that new employees in the local bilingual administration must know Sámi or acquire such competence in the first two years of employment
- to establish meeting places for the elderly with access to Sámi language, culture and ways of living.

A Sámi policy group is established within the local assembly, and a Sámi Language Centre was opened in August 2010.

171. Regarding the situation of education in Lavangen, there are three kindergartens, one of which is a Sámi kindergarten. Two groups of children are given priority of attendance, those who know Sámi and those whose parents want them to learn Sámi. All employees in that kindergarten must use Sámi. Sámi was introduced in primary and lower secondary school in 1992, and the Sámi curriculum is being implemented. In 2010, 112 pupils learned Sámi handicraft (*duodji*) and eight pupils were taught in Sámi.

172. The Sámi Language Centre runs language courses for municipal employees and the general public. It is reported that many of those who have completed the courses in Lavangen, have taken up further education in Sámi at the Sámi University College in Kautokeino.

173. The Lavangen language plan contains a number of measures to promote Sámi, amongst them:

- Language courses for all inhabitants who want it
- Strengthening Sámi competence amongst employees in the local administration and public services
- Motivating parents to choose Sámi for their children
- Bilingual reception for public offices
- Financial support for private companies who want to advertise and erect signs in Sámi
- Bilingual home page for the municipality
- Bilingual public signs.

174. Lavangen municipality will make an annual report for each year of the plan period on progress achieved and any new elements that should be included in the plan. The report will be debated in the local assembly and sent to the Sámi Parliament and the relevant ministry.

175. The Committee of Experts commends Lavangen municipality for the approach taken in the protection and promotion of Sámi in their community and looks forward to receiving information about the development and the results of the work in the next periodical report.

176. With regards to the North Sámi language in general, the Committee of Experts notes again that despite the positive development which has taken place, the language use is first and foremost concentrated in institutions in the municipalities, and much less outside the institutions, even in parts of the Sámi administrative area. The Committee of Experts has been informed that because of the internal migrations, Tromsø has become the biggest "Sámi urban centre". Additional measures therefore seem to be needed to promote the use of Sámi in Tromsø.

177. In this section, the Committee of Experts will focus on problematic areas in the protection and promotion of North Sámi. It will therefore not assess the implementation of provisions which were fulfilled in the last monitoring cycle, apart from such undertakings where the Committee of Experts has received new relevant information. The following provisions will not be commented upon:

- Article 8 Paragraph 1 a iii, b iv, c iv, d iv, e ii, f ii, g, h, i
- Article 9 Paragraph 1d
- Article 9 Paragraph 2
- Article 10 Paragraph 1 c
- Article 10 Paragraph 2 a, b, c, d, e, f, g
- Article 10 Paragraph 3 b
- Article 11 Paragraph 1 a iii, b i, c ii, e i, f ii, g
- Article 11 Paragraph 2
- Article 12 Paragraphs 2, 3
- Article 13 Paragraph 2 e

178. In respect of these provisions, the Committee of Experts refers to the conclusions reached in its fourth evaluation report, but reserves the right to evaluate the situation again at a later stage.

179. For these provisions, however, the Committee of Experts “reiterate[d] in its fourth report that they should apply to the whole Sámi Administrative District and therefore invite[d] the authorities to report on how these undertakings are fulfilled with regard to the coastal area”.

180. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities mention that new special assessments have been carried out particularly in the coastal areas, and that the municipalities of Lavangen and Kåfjord are part of the coastal areas/Coastal Sámi areas. The Municipality of Lavangen was incorporated into the administrative district for Sámi language on 1 October 2009. A Sámi language centre has been established in Lavangen, which is funded by the Sámi Parliament. Moreover in 2004, the Municipality of Tromsø opened a Sámi language centre in the Coastal Sámi village of Ullsfjord. The courses offered by the language centre include courses on Coastal Sámi cuisine and history.

181. Finally the paragraphs and sub-paragraphs that are quoted in bold italics are the obligations chosen by Norway.

Article 8 – Education

General remarks

182. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts “invite[d] the Norwegian authorities to provide specific information on the fulfilment of all undertakings in relation to education ratified by Norway in each of the municipalities covered by the Sámi Administrative District, especially the municipalities of Tana, Nesseby and Kåfjord, which the Committee of Experts has not had the possibility to visit during the on-the-spot visits so far”.

183. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that inspections were carried out in four municipalities in 2009. According to the authorities, “the discrepancies largely related to a lack of proper systems for the municipalities' duty to provide Sámi pupils with tuition in Sámi . A lack of access to teaching materials was also reported as a challenge for tuition in Sámi ”. The inspections that were carried out in eight municipalities and one county authority in 2010 led to a similar result: i.e. discrepancies in three municipalities. The results of the overview in the spring of 2010 also indicate that there may be instances where pupils entitled to tuition in Sámi are not receiving the correct number of hours in all subjects according to the Knowledge Promotion Reform's framework, which regulates the distribution of periods and subjects. Practices appear to vary among schools with regard to the number of hours of Sámi tuition. In the winter of 2011, a working group of representatives from the Sámi Parliament, the Ministry of Education and Research and the Norwegian Directorate for Education and Training presented a report on measures aimed at meeting these challenges. The Ministry of Education and Research has begun to consider the measures in the report.

184. During the last monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts invited the Norwegian authorities to clarify whether the situation for the teaching of Sámi as a second language had deteriorated since the previous monitoring round, as mentioned by the representatives of the Sámi Parliament.

185. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that according to the School Information System (GSI), in the 2010/2011 school year 928 pupils in primary and lower secondary education received tuition in North Sámi as a first language and 1145 pupils were receiving tuition in it as a second language. At the upper secondary level, statistics from the Norwegian Directorate for Education and Training/VIGO show that in the same year, 190 pupils received tuition in North Sámi as a first language and 142 in it as a second language. The analysis group for Sámi publishes "Samiske tall forteller" (Sámi figures relate) every year. In the fourth edition (2011), the analysis group points out that the clearest and most important trend in the statistics for Sámi languages in kindergarten and school for the 2010/2011 school year is the decrease in the number of pupils who choose Sámi as a Second Language in primary and lower secondary school. Sámi as a Second Language has lost 38% of its pupils since 2006. According to the authorities, these figures are to be explained by a general urbanisation, a general decline in the annual birth rate, the framework regulating the distribution of periods and subjects, discontinuation of the Sámi language and culture curriculum (2006), and the bilingual tuition model.

186. In the last evaluation report, the Committee of Experts also encouraged the Norwegian authorities, in co-operation with relevant bodies, to find ways to develop teaching materials in North Sámi that would be adapted to the new Knowledge Promotion Reform.

187. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that the Sámi Parliament (which is responsible for Sámi teaching materials), annually awards funds that are used for the development of teaching materials for Sámi languages. The authorities also mentioned that in 2009, a working group on Sámi teaching materials was established with representatives from the Sámi Parliament, the Ministry of Education and Research and the Norwegian Directorate for Education and Training. In June 2010, the group presented a report with proposals for measures for more efficient development and production of Sámi teaching materials. The Committee of Experts welcomes these positive initiatives and looks forward to receiving more information on their development in practice in the next periodical report.

Paragraph 1

With regard to education, the Parties undertake, within the territory in which such languages are used, according to the situation of each of these languages, and without prejudice to the teaching of the official language(s) of the State:

University and Higher Education

e ...

ii to provide facilities for the study of these languages as university and higher education subjects;

188. The Committee of Experts considered that the undertaking was fulfilled in the previous monitoring round. It noted the new course at the University of Tromsø, where North Sámi is taught as a foreign language; the change on the teaching of North Sámi from a subject to mother tongue education at the University of Oslo; and the unification of the Sámi University College with the Nordic Sámi Institute, creating an institution which deals with both teacher training and research in various Sámi subjects. The Committee of Experts welcomed these very positive developments and "invited the authorities to provide information about the results of these developments in the forthcoming periodical report".

189. In the fifth periodical report, the authorities state the positive developments and strengthening of Sámi course provision at the University of Tromsø where tuition is provided in 11 Sámi subjects (on grammar, syntax, literature, cultural studies and history, etc.). According to the authorities, it is however too early to say anything about the results.

190. The Committee of Experts considers that the undertaking is fulfilled and looks forward to receiving information on the results of the developments mentioned during the fourth and fifth cycles in the next periodical report.

Paragraph 2

With regard to education and in respect of territories other than those in which the regional or minority languages are traditionally used, the Parties undertake, if the number of users of a regional or minority language justifies it, to allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of the regional or minority language at all the appropriate stages of education.

191. Although the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking fulfilled in the previous reports, it considered in the fourth monitoring round that because of the migration of Sámi-speakers from the Sámi land to the Norwegian capital, clarification on the situation of Sámi education in Oslo should be given.

192. In the fifth periodical report, the authorities refer to a survey carried out by the Ministry of Government Administration, Reform and Church Affairs, the Ministry of Education and Research and the Sámi Parliament in the Spring of 2011. The purpose of the survey was to assess the language situation at an individual level among the Sámi population. The results of the survey are intended to form the basis for language planning at all levels of society, including at state, regional and municipal levels. The results will be used to design and implement measures that lead to the preservation and development of Sámi languages.

193. On the use of North Sámi in kindergarten, the Norwegian authorities inform that grants are provided to Sámi kindergartens so that Sámi can be offered as first language and culture.

194. Concerning Sámi education in Oslo, the Norwegian authorities report that 27 pupils in primary and 2 in secondary school received tuition in North Sámi as of 1 October in the 2010/2011 school year. In 2011/12, the total number of pupils being taught North Sámi is 31. This teaching is organised by Kampen School in Oslo and is additional to the ordinary tuition.

195. During the on-the-spot visit, representatives of the local authorities informed the Committee of Experts that in Oslo, there are 28 children attending the Sámi kindergarten, 33 pupils in primary and lower secondary school from February 2012 and 8 in upper secondary school. Although pupils have the right to receive education in North Sámi, all of them have chosen only to have North Sámi language classes (teaching of the language as a subject). This teaching is delivered at all levels by two teachers.

196. One complicated aspect of the teaching in the Kampen school is the distance between the local schools of the Sámi pupils and the Kampen school. Although pupils are offered free public transportation, this might be one of the causes of the low attendance and the drop out from this teaching. Another difficulty is that because of the relatively small number of pupils and the difficulty of finding qualified teachers, the teaching is delivered to many different age groups at the same time, even if the language competence of the pupils varies.

197. According to the representatives of the minority language speakers, not enough is done to let the public know about the teaching of Sámi and the procedure for enrolling children at the Kampen school is reported to be complicated.

198. The Committee of Experts welcomes the information as regards the teaching of North Sámi in Oslo. It encourages the authorities to increase their efforts in this domain and invites them to provide information on Sámi education in Tromsø in the next periodical report.

199. The Committee of Experts considers that this undertaking is fulfilled.

Article 9 - Judicial authorities

Paragraph 1

The Parties undertake, in respect of those judicial districts in which the number of residents using the regional or minority languages justifies the measures specified below, according to the situation of each of these languages and on condition that the use of the facilities afforded by the present paragraph is not considered by the judge to hamper the proper administration of justice:

a in criminal proceedings:

- i to provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the proceedings in the regional or minority languages; and/or*
- ii to guarantee the accused the right to use his/her regional or minority language; and/or*
- iii to provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible solely because they are formulated in a regional or minority language; and/or*
- iv to produce, on request, documents connected with legal proceedings in the relevant regional or minority language, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned;”*

b in civil proceedings:

- i to provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the proceedings in the regional or minority languages; and/or*
- ii to allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use his or her regional or minority language without thereby incurring additional expense; and/or*
- iii to allow documents and evidence to be produced in the regional or minority languages,*

if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations;

200. In the third monitoring round, the Committee of Experts considered the undertakings fulfilled, as a result of the efforts made by the Norwegian authorities and the Sámi Parliament to improve access to the use of Sámi in courts. In the fourth evaluation report, some difficulties were underlined and the Committee of Experts invited the authorities to report on the development of the legal terminology in North Sámi as well as on the training of lawyers and magistrates in the Sámi language and Sámi legal terminology.

201. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that in the Inner Finnmark District Court, one out of four of the court cases is (partially or exclusively) in North Sámi. Moreover, the Norwegian Courts Administration has initiated a review of efforts to safeguard the Sámi people's interests. In the spring of 2010, it established a working group tasked with investigating various issues related to the Sámi dimension of the judicial system. The working group stressed in its report that priority should be given to measures aimed at increasing knowledge about Sámi languages, culture and legal issues, as well as recruitment. The working group also proposed measures related to the development of legal terms in Sámi and expertise with regard to Sámi languages in the courts. The Norwegian authorities add that these conclusions will form the basis for the Norwegian Courts Administration's further work on safeguarding the Sámi dimension in the judicial system, including assessing specific measures to strengthen this dimension.

202. As to the measures taken for the development of Sámi legal terminology the authorities report that the Municipality of Tana had run from 2006 to 2009 a project called “Sámi legal terminology”, which particularly focused on developing terminology for the Dispute Act and the Criminal Procedure Act in North Sámi. This was followed by another two-year project called “Sámi legal terms” from 1 December 2009 to December 2011 which was funded by the Ministry of Government Administration, Reform and Church Affairs, the Sámi Parliament and the Municipality of Tana. The Sámi language board, Indre Finnmark District Court and Giellateknologijja at the University of Tromsø were important partners. The project developed legal terms in North Sámi (Criminal Procedure, Disputes and Penal terms).

203. Regarding the training of lawyers and magistrates in the Sámi language and Sámi legal terminology, neither the Ministry of Justice nor the Norwegian Courts Administration know of projects/continued education programmes for judges/executive officers or lawyers, aimed at improving their competence in Sámi languages and Sámi terminology.

204. In the fourth evaluation report, taking into consideration that cases involving citizens from Kåfjord normally do not fall under the competence of the Inner Finnmark Court, the Committee of Experts encouraged the authorities to provide more information regarding the situation in regard to Sámi speakers from Kåfjord (paragraph 167).

205. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities inform that the courts' case management system does not include the registering of language use in each individual case. Therefore, there are no statistics on how many cases were conducted using North Sámi. This also applies to cases from the Municipality of Kåfjord. However, the Norwegian authorities noted that:

- from 1 January 2011 to the present day, the Hålogaland Court of Appeal has tried five cases with interpretation in Sámi;
- since 1996 the North-Troms Land consolidation Court has tried one case with interpretation in Sámi;
- during the past 30 years, the Ofoten and Sør-Troms Land consolidation Court has tried two cases with Sámi parties. In neither of the cases was interpretation in Sámi demanded.

206. According to the Norwegian authorities, there seems to be a preference for Sámi speakers to speak Norwegian rather than Sámi and to listen to Norwegian without the intermediate of an interpreter. This appears to be the case even if an interpreter has been commissioned. The authorities add that there does not seem to be any difficulty in finding available interpreters when needed. This can be done through the Norwegian National Register of Interpreters, or by other means available.

207. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking to be fulfilled. It however encourages the authorities to continue their efforts to promote the use of North Sámi in courts.

Paragraph 3

The Parties undertake to make available in the regional or minority languages the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of these languages, unless they are otherwise provided.

208. The Committee of Experts considered the undertaking fulfilled in the previous rounds.

209. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that since the last periodical report, the Marine Resources Act, the Planning and Building Act and the Mineral Act and the regulations relating to the Mineral Act have been translated and published on the websites of the Government (www.regjeringen.no and www.lagat.no). Moreover, significant parts of the regulations based on the Tax Act, Value Added Tax Act, tax law and tax payment law are cited in Sámi in guidelines and on the tax return form. However, the actual legal texts have not been translated.

210. The Committee of Experts welcomes these positive developments and considers that the undertaking remains fulfilled.

Article 10 - Administrative authorities and public services

Paragraph 1

Within the administrative districts of the State in which the number of residents who are users of regional or minority languages justifies the measures specified below and according to the situation of each language, the Parties undertake, as far as this is reasonably possible:

- a*** ***iii*** ***to ensure that users of regional or minority languages may submit oral or written applications and receive a reply in these languages;***

211. The Committee of Experts considered the undertaking fulfilled in the previous round.

212. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities provide updated information as to the use of North Sámi with administrative authorities and public services :

- Sámi-speaking staff are employed at all five Norwegian Labour and Welfare Administration (NAV) offices in Finnmark in the municipalities in the Sámi administrative district. Four of these offices have employees who also have a command of the written language. Moreover, the customer centre in Kautokeino functions as a Sámi-speaking first line service centre for the residents of the five municipalities of the administrative district for Sámi language (Karasjok, Kautokeino, Tana, Nesseby and Porsanger). The authorities add that while it is not difficult to have oral answers and information in North Sámi, it is harder to get written answers in this language.
- as to the relation with the Tax helpline, it can be done in North Sámi when requested. Letters received in North Sámi will be replied in the same language.

213. With regard to undertakings a) and b), the Committee of Experts considered in its last evaluation report that these undertakings were fulfilled. It commended the authorities for the planned measures to increase the number of Sámi-speaking staff in prisons and encouraged them to pursue their efforts. The Committee of Experts also looked forward to receiving information on the results of the course in North Sámi language and on Sámi culture for West Finnmark police employees.

214. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities clarify that the course for police employees was intended for operational managers and police officers with ethnic Norwegian backgrounds in the Police Authority/districts where Sámi languages enjoy the same status as Norwegian. The Police Authority recognises the importance of courses in this area, but the Sámi University College stopped the programme.

215. During the on-the-spot visit, representatives from the Norwegian authorities mentioned that the Police Directorate would try to rebuild the programme.

216. The Committee of Experts was furthermore informed that a new survey on the use of North Sámi by the public authorities has been done and that the results will be made public in May 2012. It looks forward to receiving the results of this new survey in the next periodical report.

217. The Committee of Experts encourages the Norwegian authorities to continue their effort in this domain and considers that the undertaking remains fulfilled.

b to make available widely used administrative texts and forms for the population in the regional or minority languages or in bilingual versions;

218. In its previous report, the Committee of Experts noted that new documents had been translated and considered that the undertaking was fulfilled.

219. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities share updated information on the measures taken by the NAV to develop terms in Sámi and to translate documents. The NAV is in the process of translating its main leaflets, as well as various other materials into North Sámi. The part of the NAV website in North Sámi is also developing. Furthermore, the Norwegian authorities mention translations done by the Ministry of the Environment, for the kindergarten sector, within the tax field and of the Ministries websites (in the Competition field, the health sector, as well as in the fisheries, commerce, culture and transport fields).

220. The Committee of Experts welcomes these positive developments and considers that the undertaking remains fulfilled.

Paragraph 4

With a view to putting into effect those provisions of paragraphs 1, 2 and 3 accepted by them, the Parties undertake to take one or more of the following measures:

a translation or interpretation as may be required;

221. The Committee of Experts considered in its last evaluation report that the undertaking was still formally fulfilled and invited the authorities to report on the measures taken and the results of the new strategy adopted to attract students to training programmes for professional interpreters.

222. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that in 2010, the Ministry of Education and Research allocated NOK 200 000 to each of the Sámi recruitment initiatives at the University of Nordland, the University of Tromsø, Sámi University College and Nord-Trøndelag University College. In addition, NOK 1 million was allocated to collaborative efforts for the development of Sámi interpreter training. Moreover, Sámi University College, the University of Nordland, Nord-Trøndelag University College and Oslo University College have on behalf of the Ministry of Education and Research developed a model for interpreter training in Sámi languages. Oslo University College offered interpreter training in Norwegian/North Sámi in 2011. Four students were admitted to the course.

223. The Committee of Experts welcomes the positive developments which it believes will lead to a fulfilment of the undertaking in the future.

224. The Committee of Experts considers this undertaking to be partly fulfilled at present.

Paragraph 5

The Parties undertake to allow the use or adoption of family names in the regional or minority languages, at the request of those concerned.

225. In its previous evaluation report, the Committee of Experts considered this undertaking not fulfilled and strongly urged the Norwegian authorities to ensure that the national population registers and other public institutions accept Sámi names in their original form.

226. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that the Government has instructed, through a reference directory for IT standards in the public sector, that computer systems and records must support Sámi characters in the state sector, a requirement which also includes the municipalities as from 2011. The authorities state however that the transition may result in costly system changes and will therefore take some time.

227. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed that the municipalities were granted a two-year extension to implement the new regulation on Sámi characters: from 2011 the municipalities have to add the new characters when they update their systems, but they have until January 2013 to fully implement the regulation. The Norwegian authorities also mentioned that some dedicated staff are working on the issue in the Ministry of Administration.

228. The Committee of Experts welcomes the positive developments in this aspect and is looking forward to receiving information in the next periodical report on the results of the implementation of the new regulation which might lead to fulfilment of the undertaking.

229. Based on the information received, the Committee of Experts must conclude that at present the undertaking remains not fulfilled.

The Committee of Experts encourages the Norwegian authorities to ensure that the national population registers and other public institutions accept Sámi names in their original form.

Articles 11 - Media and 12 - Cultural activities and facilities

230. All undertakings under articles 11 and 12 continue to be fulfilled. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities provide updated information on media in Sámi (public and private broadcasting, written press, audiovisual productions and journalist courses) and on cultural activities (the Governmental Programme "Culture Promotion II", Sámi archives, the Sámi bibliography, The Riddu Riđđu International Indigenous Festival).

231. As far as the media are concerned, the Committee of Experts noted in the last monitoring cycle that in the municipality of Kåfjord, more should be done for broadcast media in North Sámi. It therefore invited the authorities to provide more information on this aspect.

232. During the on-the-spot visit it was mentioned that no particular broadcasting difficulty should arise in the municipality of Kåfjord. Representatives of the Norwegian authorities however admitted that there are some valleys where the broadcasting coverage is in general incomplete. The transition to total digital broadcasting that is to take place in 2015 might help in this regard.

233. The Committee of Experts considers that all undertakings under Articles 11 and 12 remain fulfilled.

Article 13 - Economic and social life**Paragraph 2**

With regard to economic and social activities, the Parties undertake, in so far as the public authorities are competent, within the territory in which the regional or minority languages are used, and as far as this is reasonably possible:

...

- c to ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the possibility of receiving and treating in their own language persons using a regional or minority language who are in need of care on grounds of ill-health, old age or for other reasons;**

234. The Committee of Experts considered in the previous evaluation report that this undertaking was still only partly fulfilled and strongly urged the authorities to ensure that social care facilities offer in practice the possibility for patients to communicate in Sámi with health personnel. Moreover, the Committee of Ministers recommended to **“Ensure that social and health care institutions within the Sámi Administrative District offer services in North Sámi”**. In the last evaluation report, the Committee of Experts believed that measures could be taken, in particular the inclusion of more teaching hours of Sámi in the education and in-service training of health personnel in the Sámi Administrative District.

235. In the fourth evaluation report, the Committee of Experts urged the authorities to “put stronger pressure and make more funds available to the regional health care authorities and to the municipalities to increase the knowledge about the Sámi culture among all the health care providers” and to apply the existing legislation.

236. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities state that the problems identified in the previous rounds regarding the use of North Sámi in the health sector are on their way to be solved. Various measures have been taken in this sphere: the Norwegian Directorate of Health is currently transforming the teaching nursing home in Karasjok into a national teaching nursing home for the Sámi population; the Sámi University College held courses for health staff in the autumn of 2010 with an emphasis on teaching Sámi language and culture. Finnmark Hospital Trust (Helse Finnmark) also has decided that all employees must complete a course in Sámi language and culture; the National Sámi Competence Centre — mental health care (SANKS) is developing a mental health care service for the Sámi population in Norway. SANKS has also, in addition to the headquarters in Finnmark, established regional offices in Tysfjord, Snåsa and Oslo. The regional offices provide a base for touring activities and a presence in many more places where Sámi live than the headquarters are able to reach. The authorities also mention that “a special Sámi scheme is being implemented under the Directorate of Health’s dementia programme.

237. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed by the authorities that the Norwegian Directorate of Health has initiated a three-year programme which is aimed at increasing the quality care for the elderly, in which eight out of nine Sámi municipalities are taking part, that a hospital in the County of Finnmark has introduced a compulsory two-day Sámi language training course for the health staff and that a specific project is aiming at using new technologies such as video conferences to improve the quality of health care. The Committee of Experts however understands that many municipalities where Sámi is used are small and peripheral, causing recruitment difficulties and a high turnover of staff. This has *per se* an impact on the health service and indirectly affects Sámi speakers.

238. The Committee of Experts welcomes the positive measures that have been taken. It asks the authorities to report on the results of these measures in the next periodical report. The Committee of Experts also encourages the authorities to study the possibility of establishing some economic incentive measures that would ensure the presence of qualified health staff in small municipalities.

239. The Committee of Experts considers that this undertaking remains partly fulfilled.

Articles 14 - Transfrontier exchanges

240. Both undertakings under article 14 continue to be fulfilled. In the fifth periodical report, the Norwegian authorities provide updated information on the founding of a Cultural centre for northern indigenous peoples in Moscow as well as on a transnational co-operation project on Sámi languages and culture in schools and kindergartens, located in the Tana Valley.

Chapter 4 – Findings and proposals for recommendations

4.1. Findings of the Committee of Experts in the fifth monitoring cycle

General situation

A. The Committee of Experts commends the Norwegian authorities for the excellent co-operation and particularly for the high quality of the periodical report. It moreover expresses its gratitude with regard to the well prepared and organised meetings during the on-the-spot visit as well as for the additional information provided after the on-the-spot-visit. This has allowed the Committee of Experts to obtain precise and relevant information on policy and legal developments in the promotion and protection of regional or minority languages in Norway. The Committee of Experts commends in particular the Norwegian authorities for their continued efforts to further improve the implementation of the Charter in Norway.

B. The Sámi Act defines the Sámi Administrative District as an area where the concentration of Sámi speakers justifies special measures. This area included from the outset the municipalities of Karasjok, Kautokeino, Nesseby, Porsanger, Tana and Kåfjord, where North Sámi is used. The Committee of Experts has in its previous reports considered the Sámi Administrative District as the area where Part III applies and consequently dealt with North Sámi as a Part III language. Since 2006 and 2007, the Lule Sámi-speaking municipality of Tysfjord and the South Sámi-speaking municipality of Snåsa respectively have been included in the Sámi Administrative District, in addition to Lavangen which was included in 2009 and where North Sámi is spoken. There is a need to clarify if the inclusion of Tysfjord and Snåsa in the Sámi Administrative District also means that Part III of the Charter should apply to Lule Sámi and South Sámi in these areas.

C. Norway does not collect official statistics regarding the users of regional or minority languages. The figures at the disposal of the Committee of Experts are only rough estimates, and surveys indicate that the actual number of speakers may be higher. The lack of reliable statistical data limits the ability of the Norwegian authorities to plan and to take appropriate measures for the protection and the promotion of Norway's regional or minority languages, and it makes an effective and targeted monitoring more difficult. It also reduces the visibility of regional or minority languages in Norway. Methods that respect privacy and personal integrity but nevertheless provide more reliable information regarding the number of users of regional or minority languages, should be developed in co-operation with the speakers.

Overview of the situation of the regional or minority languages

Part III language

D. As far as North Sámi is concerned, most of the undertakings are fulfilled. The Norwegian authorities and the Sámi Parliament are continuing their efforts to maintain this trend. With respect to court proceedings and local and regional administration, efforts are still needed to train or to recruit staff who master the relevant legal and administrative terminology in North Sámi. Additional measures are also needed to attract students to training programmes for professional interpreters.

E. The Committee of Experts has been informed of certain initiatives regarding the use of Sámi names in their original form by the national population registers and other public institutions. However, at present it is still not possible to use all Sámi names in their original form in all public registers. The Committee of Experts is aware of the ongoing work to improve the situation, which should be solved within the forthcoming monitoring cycle.

F. In the health sector and social services in the Sámi administrative area there is a general difficulty in recruiting necessary staff. Moreover, there are still not enough employees who master sufficiently North Sámi to meet the demand, even if their number is rising.

G. The inclusion of Lavangen municipality into the Sámi Administrative District will broaden the base for the use of North Sámi. Lavangen local assembly has adopted an ambitious Action Plan for the protection and promotion of North Sámi within the municipality, and the local authorities have established co-operation with the Sámi Parliament and the Government in the implementation of the Plan.

Part II languages

H. The Kven language is still in a precarious situation and therefore resolute efforts are needed to protect and promote it. A comprehensive structured policy for Kven, combined with an Action Plan, adopted in co-operation with the speakers, is needed. Immediate efforts are needed to improve the teaching in/of Kven, increased funding is needed to produce teaching materials and to strengthen the offer of teacher training in Kven. Measures are also needed to improve the presence of Kven in the media.

I. Regarding Lule and South Sámi, the authorities have pursued their efforts to protect and promote both languages. However, the languages are in a difficult position and more efforts are needed especially in the field of education. Their presence in broadcasting should also be increased.

J. Romani and Romanes are protected as non-territorial languages under the Charter. Both remain largely absent from public life and education. These languages still lack visibility and prestige, and there is a continuous need to develop positive attitudes towards Romani and Romanes in order to remove prejudices against these languages.

4.2. Proposals for recommendations on the basis of the results of the fifth monitoring cycle

The Committee of Experts, while acknowledging the efforts the Norwegian authorities have undertaken to protect the regional and minority languages used in their country, has in its evaluation chosen to concentrate on some of the most important deficiencies in the implementation of the Charter. The recommendations forwarded by the Committee of Experts to the Committee of Ministers should not, however, be interpreted as diminishing the relevance of the other, more detailed observations contained in the report, which remain valid in their own right. The recommendations proposed by the Committee of Experts are drafted accordingly.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, in accordance with Article 16, paragraph 4 of the Charter, proposes on the basis of the information contained in this report, that the Committee of Ministers make the following recommendations to Norway.

The Committee of Ministers,

In accordance with Article 16 of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages;

Having regard to the instrument of ratification submitted by Norway on 10 November 1993;

Having taken note of the evaluation made by the Committee of Experts of the Charter with respect to the application of the Charter by Norway;

Bearing in mind that this evaluation is based on information submitted by Norway in its fifth periodical report, supplementary information given by the Norwegian authorities, information submitted by bodies and associations legally established in Norway and information obtained by the Committee of Experts during its on-the-spot visit;

[Having taken note of the comments made by the Norwegian authorities on the contents of the Committee of Experts' report;]

Recommends that the Norwegian authorities take account of all the observations and recommendations of the Committee of Experts and, as a matter of priority:

1. ensure that social and health care institutions within the Sámi Administrative District, particularly in relation to elderly people, offer services in North Sámi;
2. adopt a comprehensive structured policy for Kven, combined with an action plan, in co-operation with the speakers;
3. clarify the status of the Lule and South Sámi languages in relation to Parts II and III of the Charter;

4. continue their efforts to provide teaching in/of Lule and South Sámi, including the development of teaching materials and teacher training;
5. strengthen the efforts to develop positive attitudes towards the Romani and Romanes languages.

Appendix I: Instrument of ratification**Norway :****Declarations contained in the instrument of ratification, deposited on 10 November 1993 - Or. Engl.**

We undertake to carry out the provisions contained in Parts I, II, IV and V of the Charter and also in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 2, the provisions contained in the following articles, paragraphs and sub-paragraphs of Part III of the Charter :

In Article 8 :

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (iii), b (iv), c (iv), d (iv), e (ii), f (ii), g, h, i
Paragraph 2

In Article 9 :

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i-iv), b (i-iii), d
Paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a
Paragraph 3

In Article 10 :

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (iii), b, c
Paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d, e, f, g
Paragraph 3, sub-paragraph b
Paragraph 4, sub-paragraph a
Paragraph 5

In Article 11 :

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs, a (iii), b (i), c (ii), e (i), f (ii), g
Paragraph 2

In Article 12 :

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, d, e, f, g, h
Paragraph 2
Paragraph 3

In Article 13 :

Paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs c, e

In Article 14 :

sub-paragraph b

The above-mentioned paragraphs and sub-paragraphs shall, in accordance with Article 3, paragraph 1, apply to the Sámi language.

Period covered: 1/3/1998 -

The preceding statement concerns Article(s) : 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 2, 3, 8, 9

Appendix II: Comments by the Norwegian authorities

The Norwegian Government appreciates the invitation to comment on the draft report of the Expert Committee on the implementation of the European Charter for Regional and Minority Languages. The Government is pleased to hereby provide a few comments:

Paragraph 9

The results of the survey on the Sami language situation was published in June 2012. The material gathered in the survey did not provide the researchers sufficient information to estimate the number of persons in command of the Sami languages.

Paragraph 32

We recommend that the following sentence is amended as indicated in italic:
During the on-the-spot visit, the representatives of the Romani people/ Taters mentioned a project aiming [...].

Paragraph 82

The Expert Committee refers to information provided by representatives of the Sami Parliament regarding a recent PhD study on ethnic discrimination in relation to physical and mental health in Sami settlements areas in Norway. In the Government's view, there seems to be a slight misunderstanding as regards the study's conclusions on the provision of health services in Sami language outside the Sami Administrative Area. We forward the link to the study for the attention of the Expert Committee (see page 69 for main findings):

http://uit.no/Content/235598/skriftserie%20115_munin.pdf

The report of the Expert Committee will be published on our websites.
We would like to take this opportunity to thank the Expert Committee for its diligent work and to express our support for the Committee's ongoing efforts.